BUNREACHT NA ÉIREANN CONSTITUTION OF IRELAND



Tithe an Oireachtais Houses of the Oireachtas

An Choiste um Oideachas, Breisoideachas agus Ardoicheachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaí An Choiste um Oideachas, Breisoideachas agus Ardoicheachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíocht Tuarascáil Bhliantúil 2023

> Joint Committee on Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science Annual Report 2023

> > February 2024

## **MEMBERSHIP**



Sorca Clarke TD Sinn Féin



Cathal Crowe TD Fianna Fáil



Paul Kehoe TD Fine Gael (Cathaoirleach)



Carol Nolan TD Independent



Jim O'Callaghan TD Fianna Fáil



Marc O Cathasaigh TD Green Party



Mairéad Farrell TD Sinn Féin



Aodhán Ó Ríordáin TD Labour Party



Pádraig O'Sullivan TD Fianna Fáil



Senator Aisling Dolan Fine Gael



Senator Eileen Flynn Independent



Senator Rónán Mullen Independent



Senator Fiona O'Loughlin Fianna Fáil (Leas-Cathaoirleach)



Senator Pauline O'Reilly Green Party

Page 1 of 115

# **Table of Contents**

ME	MBERSHIP1
1.	Content and Format of Report
2.	Establishment and Functions
2.2 2.3	Establishment of the Joint Committee
3.	Cathaoirleach, Leas-Cathaoirleach and Membership4
4.	Meetings, Attendance and Recording4
5.	Number and Duration of Meetings5
5.1 5.2	Joint Committee
6.	Witnesses attending before the Committee(s)6
7.	Committee Reports Published6
8.	Travel7
9.	EU Mainstreaming9
9.1	Legislative Proposals9
9	Reports on Functions and Powers10
10	APPENDIX 1 – Order of Reference 11
AP	PENDIX 2: Membership20
AP	PENDIX 3 – Meetings of the Joint Committee
AP	PENDIX 4: Minutes of Proceedings of the Joint Commitee
AP	PENDIX 5: Meetings of the Dáil Select Committee
AP	PENDIX 6: Proceedings of the Select Committee (Imeachtaí)

## **Content and Format of Report**

This report has been prepared pursuant to Standing Order 100 (3), (4), (5) and (6), (Dáil Éireann) and Standing Order 77 (3), (4), (5) and (6) (Seanad Éireann) which provide for the Joint Committee to-

- undertake a review of its procedure and its role generally;
- prepare an annual work programme;
- lay minutes of its proceedings before both Houses;
- make an annual report to both Houses.

At its meeting on the 13 Februay 2024, the Joint Committee agreed that all these items should be included in this report covering the period from 1 January 2023 to 31 December 2023.

## **Establishment and Functions**

#### 2.1. Establishment of the Select Committee

The Dáil Select Committee was established by Order of Dáil Éireann of the 30<sup>th</sup> July 2020, to consider Bills, Estimates for Public Services, Motions, and the terms of any international agreement involving a charge on public funds, which come within the aegis of the Department on Education and Department of Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science.

The Select Committee may also consider Annual Output Statements, Value for Money Reviews and Policy Reviews prepared by the relevant Government Department.

#### 2.2 Establishment of the Joint Committee

The Dáil Select Committee, under the same Order, was enjoined with a Select Committee of Seanad Éireann, established by Order of Seanad Éireann of the 18<sup>th</sup> September 2020 to form the Joint Committee on Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science.

#### **Functions of the Joint Committee**

Among the principal functions of the Joint Committee are to consider-

- Public affairs administered by the Department of Education and Department of Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science.
- Matters of policy for which the Minister for Education and Minister for Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science are responsible for.
- legislative and expenditure proposals for both Departments.
- EU legislative proposals.
- Certain matters relating to bodies under the aegis of the Department of Education and Department of Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science.

The Orders of Reference of the Dáil Select Committee and the Joint Committee are set out at Appendix 1.

### Cathaoirleach, Leas-Cathaoirleach and Membership

Dáil Standing Order 104 (2) provides for a proportion of Cathaoirligh to be allocated to each group by means of the D'Hondt System. Deputy Paul Kehoe was appointed as Cathaoirleach of the Select Committee on 3<sup>rd</sup> September 2020 by an Order of Dáil Éireann. The Cathaoirleach of the Select Committee is also the Cathaoirleach of the Joint Committee. Senator Fiona O'Loughlin was elected as Leas-Cathaoirleach of the Joint Committee on the 8<sup>th</sup> October 2020.

Membership of the Committee, including all internal changes within the reported period, is listed at Appendix 2.

#### Meetings, Attendance and Recording

Meetings of the Joint Committee and Select Committee took place in the Committee rooms in Leinster House 2000. Meetings were in public unless otherwise ordered by the Committee.

Committee proceedings were broadcast live within Leinster House and also made available to RTE, TV3 and TG4. Proceedings were also live streamed on our website

and through our app. Since September 2014 the proceedings of Committees in public session, typically recorded but occasionally live, are broadcast on the dedicated parliamentary channel Oireachtas TV which is available on these channels:

Saorview 22, Sky 517, Virgin Media 207, Eir Vision 504 Vodafone Channels 201, 207 (Dáil Éireann) and 208 (Seanad Éireann)

An Official Report (Parliamentary Debates) of the public meetings of the Committee may be viewed on the Houses of the Oireachtas website at www.oireachtas.ie.

Copies of other reports published by the Joint Committee are also available on the Oireachtas Committee website pages at <u>www.oireachtas.ie</u>. A list of these reports is set out at paragraph 7.

### **Number and Duration of Meetings**

#### Joint Committee

The Joint Committee met 25 times, this includes 9 meetings that are both private and public meetings, occasions during the period under report. The number of hours of discussion involved in these meetings was in excess of 55 hours.

The Committee met privately 5 times in 2023.

The subject matter of each meeting of the Joint Committee, including the groups, organisations or individuals who attended the meetings, is detailed in Appendix 3. The Minutes of Proceedings of the Joint Committee in public session are attached at Appendix 4.

#### **Select Committee**

The Dáil Select Committee met 5 times during the period under report and the number of hours of discussion involved in these meetings was in excess of 5 hours.

The subject matter of each meeting, including the groups, organisations or individuals who attended the meetings of the Select Committee, is detailed in *Appendix 5.* The proceedings (Imeachtaí) of the Select Committee are attached at *Appendix 6.* 

## Witnesses attending before the Committee(s)

During the period, the number of speaking witnesses for each of the Committees was as follows:

	NUMBER OF WITNESSES
Joint Committee	119
Select Committee	5

## **Committee Reports Published**

During the period under report, the Joint Committee published the following reports:

Work Programme 2023.

Annual Report 2022.

Mental Health Supports in Schools and Tertiary Education 24 January 2023

Travel Report, TU Dublin and SETU Waterford, 20th - 21st April 2023.

Report on Pre Legislative Scrutiny of the Research and Innovation Bill, 11 July 2023.

The Future of Science, Technology, Engineering and Maths (STEM) in Irish Education 11 July 2023

Travel Report, Holy Family School for the Deaf, Cabra, 14<sup>th</sup> November 2023 Report on Pre Legislative Supports for Survivors of Residential Intistuional Abuse Bill, 12<sup>th</sup> December 2023

## Travel

The Joint Committee undertook the following travel in accordance with its Orders of Reference in connection with its Work Programme.

<u>Purpose of Travel:</u> Study Visit to Ballyfermot College of Further Education <u>Date and Destination:</u> Wednesday, 22 March 2023, Ballyfermot College of Further Education

<u>Members Travelling:</u> Mr. Jim O'Callaghan T.D. and Senator Eileen Flynn. <u>Accompanying Officials</u>: Ms. Niamh Murray, Policy Advisor.

Purpose of Travel: Study Visits to TU Dublin and SETU Waterford.

<u>Date and Destination</u>: Saturday 20 and Sunday 21 April 2023, Technological University Dublin, Grangegorman Campus and South East Technological University (SETU) Waterford.

<u>Members Travelling:</u> Paul Kehoe (Cathaoirleach), Jim O'Callaghan T.D., Marc Ó'Cathasaigh T.D., and Senators Fiona O'Loughlin.

<u>Accompanying Officials:</u> Ms. Tara Kelly, Committee Clerk and Mr. Julian Power Foley, Policy Advisor, Committee Secretariat.

<u>Purpose of Travel:</u> Higher Education, Research and Industry Conference: "The UK and Ireland: Moving Forward Together". <u>Date and Destination:</u> Sunday 21 to Tuesday 23 May 2023, Higher Education,

Research and industry Conference London.

Members Travelling: Paul Kehoe (Cathaoirleach)

Accompanying Officials: N/A

Purpose of Travel: Study Visit to Holy Family School for the Deaf

<u>Date and Destination</u>: Tuesday 14 November 2023, Holy Family School for the Deaf, Cabra, Dublin 7

<u>Members Travelling:</u> Paul Kehoe (Cathaoirleach), Sorca Clarke TD, Mairéad Farrell TD, and Senators Eileen Flynn, and Fiona O'Loughlin, Deputy Neasa Hourigan and Senator Marie Sherlock also attended as the school is in their local area. <u>Accompanying Officials:</u> Ms. Tara Kelly, Committee Clerk, Julian Power Foley, Committee Policy Advisor, and Emma Greene, Junior Clerk.

<u>Purpose of Travel:</u> Inter-Parliamentary Committee Meeting on European Citizenship Education <u>Date and Destination:</u> Sunday 26 to Tuesday 28 November 2023, European Parliament, Brussels <u>Members Travelling:</u> Paul Kehoe (Cathaoirleach), Sorca Clarke TD, Marc Ó Cathasaigh TD, and Senator Rónán Mullen <u>Accompanying Officials:</u> Ms. Tara Kelly, Committee Clerk, Julian Power Foley,

Committee Policy Advisor.

# **EU Mainstreaming**

#### 9.1 Legislative Proposals

From January to December 2023, the Joint Committee considered EU matters at 2 meetings involving consideration of the following 2 legislative proposals:

PROPOSAL NO.	PROPOSAL TITLE	OUTCOME
COM(2023)359	Proposal for a DECISION OF THE EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT AND OF THE COUNCIL amending Decision (EU) 2017/1324 as regards the continuation of the Union's participation in the Partnership for Research and	No further scrutiny
	Innovation in the Mediterranean Area (PRIMA) under Horizon Europe	
COM(2023)502	Proposal for a DIRECTIVE OF THE EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT AND OF THE COUNCIL amending and correcting Directive 2005/36/EC as regards the recognition of professional qualifications of nurses responsible for general care trained in Romania (Text with EEA relevance)	No Further Scrutiny

No further action or scrutiny was required for either proposal.

Page 9 of 115

# **Reports on Functions and Powers**

The Joint Committee is currently satisfied with its present procedures and role.

a1\_

Paul Kehoe T.D. Cathaoirleach 13 February 2024

## **APPENDIX 1 – Order of Reference**

# Scope and Context of Activities of Committees (derived from Standing Orders – DSO 94 (2), SSO 70)

The Joint Committee may only consider such matters, engage in such activities, exercise such powers and discharge such functions as are specifically authorised under its orders of reference and under Standing Orders;

such matters, activities, powers and functions shall be relevant to, and shall arise only in the context of, the preparation of a report to the Dáil/and or Seanad;

the Joint Committee shall not consider any matter which is being considered, or of which notice has been given of a proposal to consider, by the Committee of Public Accounts pursuant to Dáil Standing Order 218/Seanad Standing Order 186 and/or the Comptroller and Auditor General (Amendment) Act 1993;

the Joint Committee shall not consider any matter which is being considered, or of which notice has been given of a proposal to consider, by the Joint Committee on Public Petitions in the exercise of its functions under Dáil Standing Order 125(1)/Seanad Standing Order 108(1); and

the Joint Committee shall refrain from inquiring into in public session or publishing confidential information regarding any matter if so requested, for stated reasons given in writing, by—

(i) a member of the Government or a Minister of State, or

(ii) the principal office-holder of a body under the aegis of a Department or which is partly or wholly funded by the State or established or appointed by a member of the Government or by the Oireachtas:

Provided that the Chairman may appeal any such request made to the Ceann Comhairle, whose decision shall be final. It shall be an instruction to all Select Committees to which Bills are referred that they shall ensure that not more than two Select Committees shall meet to consider a Bill on any given day, unless the Dáil, after due notice given by the Chairman of the Select Committee, waives this instruction on motion made by the Taoiseach pursuant to Standing Order 35. The Chairmen of Select Committees shall have responsibility for compliance with this instruction.

Functions of Departmental Committees (derived from Standing Orders – DSO 95 and SSO 71)

(1) The Select Committee shall consider and report to the Dáil on-

(*a*) such aspects of the expenditure, administration and policy of a Government Department or Departments and associated public bodies as the Committee may select, and

(*b*) European Union matters within the remit of the relevant Department or Departments.

(2) The Select Committee may be joined with a Select Committee appointed by Seanad Éireann for the purposes of the functions set out in this Standing Order, other than at paragraph (3), and to report thereon to both Houses of the Oireachtas.

(3) Without prejudice to the generality of paragraph (1), the Select Committee shall consider, in respect of the relevant Department or Departments, such—

(a) Bills,

(*b*) proposals contained in any motion, including any motion within the meaning of Dáil Standing Order 220,

(c) Estimates for Public Services, and

(d) other matters

as shall be referred to the Select Committee by the Dáil, and

(e) Annual Output Statements including performance, efficiency and effectiveness in the use of public moneys, and

(*f*) such Value for Money and Policy Reviews as the Select Committee may select.

(4) Without prejudice to the generality of paragraph (1), the Joint Committee may consider the following matters in respect of the relevant Department or Departments and associated public bodies:

(*a*) matters of policy and governance for which the Minister is officially responsible,

(b) public affairs administered by the Department,

(*c*) policy issues arising from Value for Money and Policy Reviews conducted or commissioned by the Department,

(*d*) Government policy and governance in respect of bodies under the aegis of the Department,

(e) policy and governance issues concerning bodies which are partly or wholly funded by the State or which are established or appointed by a member of the Government or the Oireachtas,

(f) the general scheme or draft heads of any Bill

(g) scrutiny of private members' Bills in accordance with Dáil Standing Order 178,
 or detailed scrutiny of private members' Bills in accordance with Dáil Standing Order
 161

(*h*) any post-enactment report laid before either House or both Houses by a member of the Government or Minister of State on any Bill enacted by the Houses of the Oireachtas,

(*i*) statutory instruments, including those laid or laid in draft before either House or both Houses and those made under the European Communities Acts 1972 to 2009,

(*j*) strategy statements laid before either or both Houses of the Oireachtas pursuant to the Public Service Management Act 1997,

(*k*) annual reports or annual reports and accounts, required by law, and laid before either or both Houses of the Oireachtas, of the Department or bodies referred to in

subparagraphs (*d*) and (*e*) and the overall performance and operational results, statements of strategy and corporate plans of such bodies, and

(*I*) such other matters as may be referred to it by the Dáil from time to time.

(5) Without prejudice to the generality of paragraph (1), the Joint Committee shall consider, in respect of the relevant Department or Departments—

(*a*) EU draft legislative acts standing referred to the Select Committee under Dáil Standing Order 133/Seanad Standing Order 116, including the compliance of such acts with the principle of subsidiarity,

(*b*) other proposals for EU legislation and related policy issues, including programmes and guidelines prepared by the European Commission as a basis of possible legislative action,

(c) non-legislative documents published by any EU institution in relation to EU policy matters, and

(*d*) matters listed for consideration on the agenda for meetings of the relevant EU Council of Ministers and the outcome of such meetings.

(6) Where the Select Committee has been joined with a Select Committee appointed by Seanad Éireann, the Chairman of the Dáil Select Committee shall also be the Chairman of the Joint Committee.

(7) The following may attend meetings of the Select or Joint Committee, for the purposes of the functions set out in paragraph (5) and may take part in proceedings without having a right to vote or to move motions and amendments:

(*a*) members of the European Parliament elected from constituencies in Ireland, including Northern Ireland,

(*b*) members of the Irish delegation to the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe, and

(*c*) at the invitation of the Committee, other members of the European Parliament.

(8) The Joint Committee may, in respect of any Ombudsman charged with oversight of public services within the policy remit of the relevant Department or Departments, consider—

(*a*) such motions relating to the appointment of an Ombudsman as may be referred to the Committee, and

(*b*) such Ombudsman reports laid before either or both Houses of the Oireachtas as the Committee may select: Provided that the provisions of Dáil Standing Order 130/Seanad Standing Order 113 apply where the Select Committee has not considered the Ombudsman report, or a portion or portions thereof, within two months (excluding Christmas, Easter or summer recess periods) of the report being laid before either or both Houses of the Oireachtas. Powers of Committees (derived from Standing Orders – DSO 96, 133 and 135 and SSO 71, 116 and 118)

The Joint Committee has: -

(1) power to take oral and written evidence and to print and publish from time to time minutes of such evidence taken in public before the Select Committee together with such related documents as the Select Committee thinks fit;

(2) power to invite and accept oral presentations and written submissions from interested persons or bodies;

(3) power to send for persons, papers and records (see also DSO 99/SSO 76);

(4) power to appoint sub-Committees and to refer to such sub-Committees any matter comprehended by its orders of reference and to delegate any of its powers to such sub-Committees, including power to report directly to the Dáil;

(5) power to draft recommendations for legislative change and for new legislation;

(6) power to examine any statutory instrument, including those laid or laid in draft before either House or both Houses and those made under the European Communities Acts 1972 to 2009, and to recommend, where it considers that such action is warranted, whether the instrument should be annulled or amended;

(7) for the purposes of paragraph (6), power to require any Government Department or instrument-making authority concerned to submit a Memorandum to the Select Committee explaining any statutory instrument under consideration or to attend a meeting of the Select Committee for the purpose of explaining any such statutory instrument: Provided that such Department or authority may decline to attend for stated reasons given in writing to the Select Committee, which may report thereon to the Dáil;

(8) power to require that a member of the Government or Minister of State shall attend before the Select Committee to discuss policy for which he or she is officially responsible: Provided that a member of the Government or Minister of State may decline to attend for stated reasons given in writing to the Select Committee, which may report thereon to the Dáil: and provided further that a member of the Government or Minister of State may request to attend a meeting of the Select Committee to enable him or her to discuss such policy;

(9) power to require that a member of the Government or Minister of State shall attend before the Select Committee to discuss proposed primary or secondary legislation (prior to such legislation being published) for which he or she is officially responsible: Provided that a member of the Government or Minister of State may decline to attend for stated reasons given in writing to the Select Committee, which may report thereon to the Dáil: and provided further that a member of the Government or Minister of State may request to attend a meeting of the Select Committee to enable him or her to discuss such proposed legislation;

(10) power to require that a member of the Government or Minister of State shall attend before the Select Committee and provide, in private session if so requested by the member of the Government or Minister of State, oral briefings in advance of meetings of the relevant EU Council of Ministers to enable the Select Committee to make known its views: Provided that the Committee may also require such attendance following such meetings;

(11) power to require that the Chairperson designate of a body or agency under the aegis of a Department shall, prior to his or her appointment, attend before the Select Committee to discuss his or her strategic priorities for the role;

(12) power to require that a member of the Government or Minister of State who is officially responsible for the implementation of an Act shall attend before a Select Committee in relation to the consideration of a report under Standing Order 197;

(13) subject to any constraints otherwise prescribed by law, power to require that principal office-holders in bodies in the State which are partly or wholly funded by the State or which are established or appointed by members of the Government or by the Oireachtas shall attend meetings of the Committee, as appropriate, to discuss issues for which they are officially responsible: Provided that such an office-holder may

decline to attend for stated reasons given in writing to the Committee, which may report thereon to the Dáil;

(14) power to engage, subject to the consent of the Houses of the Oireachtas Commission, the services of persons with specialist or technical knowledge, to assist it or any of its sub-Committees in considering particular matters; and

(15) power to undertake travel, subject to—

(*a*) such recommendations as may be made by the Working Group of Committee Chairmen under DSO 120(4)(*a*) and SSO 107(4)(*a*); and

(*b*) the consent of the Houses of the Oireachtas Commission, and normal accounting procedures.

In accordance with Articles 6 of Protocol No. 2 to the Treaty on European Union and the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union (*Protocol on the Application of the Principles of Subsidiarity and Proportionality*) as applied by sections 7(3) of the European Union Act 2009, the Committee has the power to-

consider whether any act of an institution of the European Union infringes the principle of subsidiarity (DSO 135; SSO 118); and

form a reasoned opinion that a draft legislative act (within the meaning of Article 3 of the said Protocol) does not comply with the principle of subsidiarity (DSO 133 and SSO 116).

## **APPENDIX 2: Membership**

#### List of Members of the Joint Committee

(The Select Committee membership comprises of Deputies only)

- Deputies: Sorca Clarke (SF) Cathal Crowe (FF) Paul Kehoe (FG) (Cathaoirleach) Carol Nolan (Ind) Jim O'Callaghan (FF) Marc O Cathasaigh (GP) Mairead Farrell (SF) Aodhán Ó Ríordáin (LP) Pádraig O'Sullivan (FF)
- Senators: Aisling Dolan (FG) Eileen Flynn (I) Rónán Mullen (I) Fiona O'Loughlin (FF) (Leas-Cathaoirleach) Pauline O'Reilly (GP)

#### Notes:

Deputies nominated by the Dáil Committee of Selection and appointed by Order of the Dáil of 31<sup>st</sup> July 2020.

Senators nominated by the Seanad Committee of Selection and appointed by Order of the Seanad on 16<sup>th</sup> September 2020.

Senator Fiona O'Loughlin elected as Leas-Cathaoirleach on 8<sup>th</sup> October 2020.

Deputy Alan Farrell discharged, and Deputy Cathal Crowe nominated to serve in his stead by the Fifteenth Report of the Dáil Committee of Selection as agreed by Dáil Éireann on 23 June 2022.

# **APPENDIX 3 – Meetings of the Joint Committee**

The following are the details, in date order, of the scheduled meetings of the Joint Committee which took place during the period under report.

Meeting No. and Date	Торіс	Organisations, Groups and Individuals who attended
J93 24/01/23	Private Meeting	N/A
J94 31/01/23	Briefing on Current and Future Plans for the School Building Unit	Mr. Hubert Loftus, Assistant Secretary, Head of Planning & Building Unit, Department of Education
		Ms. Martina Mannion , Assistant Secretary, Head of Inclusion Division, Department of Education
		Ms. Áine Cusack, Principal Officer, Schools Capital Appraisal Section, Department of Education
		Mr. John Dolan, Technical Manager with lead responsibility for Climate strategy for decarbonisation of School Buildings, Department of Education
		Mr. Brendan Doody, Principal Officer, Special Education Section, Department of Education
		Mr. Martin Mcloughlin, Principal Officer, Special Education Section, Department of Education
J95 14/02/23	Private	N/A

Meeting No. and Date	Торіс	Organisations, Groups and Individuals who attended
	Roundtable Discussion on North South Student Enrolment in Tertiary Education	Session 1: Dr Vivienne Patterson, Head of Skills, Engagement and Statistics, Higher Education Authority (HEA) Mr Andrew Brownlee, Chief Executive Officer, SOLAS Ms Heather Cousins, Deputy Secretary, Skills and Education Group, Department for the Economy, Northern
		Ireland Mr Ian McKenna, Principal Officer, International Cooperation Unit, Department of Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science
		Session 2:
		Mr Frank Jones, General Secretary, Irish Federation of University Teachers (IFUT)
		Mr Colm Kelly, Assistant Secretary, Teachers' Union of Ireland (TUI)

Meeting No.	Торіс	Organisations, Groups and
and Date		Individuals who attended
J96 21/02/23	Roundtable Discussion on North	Session 1:
	South Student Enrolment in Tertiary Education	Professor Ciarán Ó hÓgartaigh, President, University of Galway, Universities Ireland
		Mr. Paul Hannigan, Head of College, Atlantic Technological University, Donegal, Technological Higher Education Association
		Mr. Lewis Purser, Director of Teaching, Learning & Academic Affairs, Irish <i>Universities Association</i>
		Session 2:
		Dr Anthony Soares, Director, Centre for Cross Border Studies
		Professor Gerry McKenna MRIA, Senior Vice President, Royal Irish Academy
		Mr. Martin McKendry, College Director, College of Agriculture Food and Rural Enterprise
J97 28/02/23	Private Session	N/A
	Roundtable Discussion on the Future of Science, Technology, Engineering and Maths (STEM) in Irish Education.	Mr. John Irwin, General Secretary, Association of Community and Comprehensive Schools (ACCS)
		Mr. John Curtis, General Secretary, Joint Managerial Body
		Mr. Martin Gormley, Director of Schools, Donegal Education and Training Board (DETB), Education and Training Boards Ireland (ETBI)

Meeting No. and Date	Торіс	Organisations, Groups and Individuals who attended
J98 07/03/23	Roundtable Discussion on the Future of Science, Technology, Engineering and Maths (STEM) in Irish Education (continued)	Session 1: Mr Paul Crone, Director, National Association of Principals and Deputies (NAPD)
		<b>Session 2:</b> Mr Frank Jones, General Secretary, Irish Federation of University Teachers (IFUT)
		Ms Máirín Ní Chéileachair, Head of Education and Research/Assistant General Secretary, Irish National Teachers' Organisation (INTO)
		Ms Moira Leydon, Assistant General Secretary, Education & Research, Association of Secondary Teachers Ireland (ASTI)
		Ms Caitlin Faye Maniti, President, Irish Second-Level Students' Union (ISSU)
		Mr David Duffy, Education and Research Officer, Teachers' Union of Ireland (TUI)
		Beth O'Reilly, President, Union of Students in Ireland
J99 21/03/23	Private Session	N/A

Meeting No. and Date	Торіс	Organisations, Groups and Individuals who attended
	Roundtable Discussion on the Future of Science, Technology, Engineering and Maths (STEM) in Irish Education (continued)	Ministrational Session 1:      Mr Ciarán Duffy, Chairperson of      National Council, Irish Maths Teachers'      Association      Mr Barry Convey, National      Chairperson, Engineering Technology
		Teachers' Association Mr Humphrey Jones, Vice- Chairperson, Irish Science Teachers' Association
		Professor Lisa Looney, DCU Vice President for Academic Affairs and Registrar, representing the Irish Universities Association (IUA) Dr Mary Kelly, Academic Dean, Hibernia College, representing Higher Education Colleges Association
		(HECA) Dr Maria Kyne, Dean of Faculty of Engineering and the Built Environment, Technological University of the Shannon: Midlands Midwest, representingTechnological Higher Education Association (THEA)

Meeting No. and Date	Торіс	Organisations, Groups and Individuals who attended
J100 28/03/2023	Motion: That Dáil Éireann and Seanad Éireann approves the Employment Equality Act 1998 (Section 12) (Reservation of Vocational Training Places) Order 2022.	Session 1: Mr Thomas Byrne TD, Minister of State for Sport and Physical Education Ms Sinéad Middleton, Assistant Principal, Department of Education Ms Jill Fannin, Principal Officer, Department of Education
	Roundtable Discussion on the Future of Science, Technology, Engineering and Maths (STEM) in Irish Education (continued)	Session 2: Dr Ruth Freeman, Director of Science for Society, Science Foundation Ireland (SFI)
		Mr Lee Reynolds, Head of Ireland & Northern Ireland, Institute of Physics
	Roundtable Discussion on the	Session 3:
	Future of Science, Technology, Engineering and Maths (STEM) in Irish Education (continued)	Ms. Claire McGee, Head of Education and Innovation Policy, Irish Business and Employers Confederation (IBEC)
		Ms. Helen McMahon, Senior Strategy Policy Advisor, Enterprise Ireland
		Mr Neil McDonnell, Chief Executive, Irish Small and Medium Enterprises (ISME)
		Ms Aisling Soden, Project Manager, Talent Transformation and Innovation Department, IDA Ireland
		Mr. Michael Fitzgerald, Technical Training & Development Manager, ESB Networks
	Private Session	N/A

and Date  Indi    J101 18/04/23  Roundtable Discussion on the Future of Science, Technology, Engineering and Maths (STEM) in Irish Education  Dr    Dr.A  Dr.A    Tect  Inst    Lim  Dr    Prot  Dr    Dr  Prot    Dr  Prot	anisations, Groups and viduals who attended sion 1: Sarah McCormack, Professor in rgy Engineering, Department of , Structural and Environmental ineering, Trinity College Dublin ann Marcus-Quinn, Lecturer in mical Communication and uctional Design, University of erick (UL) Cornelia Connolly, Associate essor, University of Galway
Future of Science, Technology, Engineering and Maths (STEM) in Irish Education    Dr Ene Civi Eng      Dr.A Tec Inst Lim      Dr      Dr      Tec Inst      Dr      Proi      Dr      Tec      Inst      Dr      Proi      Dr      Proi      Dr      Edu	Sarah McCormack, Professor in rgy Engineering, Department of , Structural and Environmental ineering, Trinity College Dublin ann Marcus-Quinn, Lecturer in mnical Communication and uctional Design, University of erick (UL) Cornelia Connolly, Associate
Cha Edu Ses Mr. BT The Mr. Wor	Margaret Leahy, Head of School of M Education, Innovation & Global lies, Dublin City University sine Hyland, Emeritus Professor of cation, University College Cork essor Hamsa Venkat, Naughton ir - Early Years/Primary STEM cation, Dublin City University sion 2: Liam Carew & Mr. Shane O'Connor, Young Scientists of the Year 2023, Abbey School Tipperary Jamie Bermingham, Plumber & IdSkills Ireland Plumbing & Heating mpion 2022.
BT The Mr. Woi Cha Mr.	Young Scientists of the Year 2023, Abbey School Tipperary Jamie Bermingham, Plumber & IdSkills Ireland Plumbing & Heating

Meeting No. and Date	Торіс	Organisations, Groups and Individuals who attended
J102 25/04/23	Roundtable Discussion on the	Session 1:
	Future of Science, Technology, Engineering and Maths (STEM) in Irish Education	Ms Evelyn O'Connor, Principal Officer, Curriculum and Assessment Policy Unit, Department of Education
		Ms Karen Murtagh, Assistant Principal, Curriculum and Assessment Policy Unit, Department of Education
		Mr Diarmuid Mooney, Acting Director, Curriculum and Assessment, National Council for Curriculum and Assessment
		Ms Arlene Forster, Chief Executive, National Council for Curriculum and Assessment
		Ms Andrea Feeney, Chief Executive Officer, State Examinations Commission
		Ms Elaine Sheridan, Head of Examinations and Assessment, State Examinations Commission
		Session 2:
		Dr Mary-Liz Trant, Director, National Apprenticeship Office
		Dr. Peter Cullen, Head of Research and Innovation, Quality and Qualifications Ireland (QQI)
		Dr Vivienne Patterson, Head of Skills, Engagement and Statistics, Higher Education Authority (HEA)
		Mr Paddy Howard, Principal Officer, Innovation, Research Organisations and Programmes Department of Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science
		Mr Andrew Brownlee, Chief Executive Officer, SOLAS
J103 09/05/23	Private	N/A

Meeting No. and Date	Торіс	Organisations, Groups and Individuals who attended
•	Topic      Pre Legislative Scrutiny of the Research and Innovation Bill, 2023	•
		Mr. Waqar Ahmed, VP Postgraduate Affairs, Union of Students Ireland (USI) (Provisional)
		Dr. John Walsh, Irish Federation of University Teachers (IFUT)
		Ms. Annette Dolan, Deputy General Secretary, Teachers' Union of Ireland (TUI)

Meeting No. and Date	Торіс	Organisations, Groups and Individuals who attended
J104 16/05/23	Pre Legislative Scrutiny of the General Scheme of the Research and Innovation Bill, 2023	Session 1:
		Professor Daniel Carey, Chair, Irish Research Council (IRC) Board
		Professor Philip Nolan, Director General, Science Foundation Ireland (SFI)
		Mr. Tim Conlon, Head of Policy and Strategic Planning, Higher Education Authority (HEA)
		Dr Deirdre Lillis, Assistant Secretary General, Department of Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science (DFHERIS)
		Session 2:
		Professor Helen Kelly-Holmes Professor of Applied Languages, School of Modern Languages and Applied Linguistics, University of Limerick (UL)
		Professor Jim Livesey, Vice President, Research & Innovation, University of Galway (UG)
		Professor Cormac Taylor, Professor of Cellular Physiology, Conway Institute, University College Dublin (UCD)
J105 23/05/23	Private Session	N/A

Meeting No.	Торіс	Organisations, Groups and
and Date	•	Individuals who attended
	Education Needs of Visually Impaired Students (National Council for the Blind in Ireland)	Session 1: National Council for the Blind in Ireland (NCBI)
		Mr Toni O Dwyer, NCBI Children's and Young, Person Service Manager
		Ms Edel O Doherty, Senior Practitioner NCBI Children's and Young Persons Service
	Education of Deaf and Hard of Hearing Students	<b>Session 2</b> Mr Andrew Geary
J106	Professional Accreditation of	Session 1:
30/05/2023	Higher Education (HE) courses with specific reference to Health and Social Care Professions	Dr. Padraig Walsh, Chief Executive. Quality and Qualifications Ireland (QQI)
		Ms. Ginny Hanrahan, Chief Executive and Registrar, Coru
		Professor Orla Sheils, Vice-Provost and Chief Academic Officer of Trinity College, representing the Irish Universities Association (IUA).
		Ms Mary McHugh, Technological University of the Shannon Midlands Mid West (TUS), representing Technological Higher Education Association (THEA)
		Ms Patricia O Sullivan, Executive Director, Higher Education Colleges Association (HECA)
		Session 2:
		Mr. Simon Harris TD, Minister for Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science
J107 13/06/2023	Cancelled	

Meeting No. and Date	Торіс	Organisations, Groups and Individuals who attended
J108 21/06/2023	Private Session	N/A
	Motion: re Proposed approval by Dáil and Seanad Éireann of the Technological Universities Act 2018 (Section 44F) (Appointed Day) Order	Session 1: Mr. Simon Harris T.D., Minister for Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science
	Discussion on key issues	Session 2:
		Mr. Simon Harris T.D., Minister for Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science
J109 04/07/23	Briefing on the Education Needs of Deaf and Hard of Hearing Students	Session 1: Mr. Brendan Doody, Principal Officer, Special Education Unit, DE
		Ms Evelyn O'Connor, Principal Officer, Curriculum and Assessment Unit
		Mr. Frank Hanlon, Principal Officer, Special Education Unit, DE
		Mr. Kieran Rogers, Assistant Principal Officer, Special Education Unit, DE
		Mr. Mark Kelly, Technical Manager, Planning and Building Unit, DE
		Ms. Martina Mannion Assistant Secretary with responsibility for Special Education and Inclusion, DE

Meeting No. and Date	Торіс	Organisations, Groups and Individuals who attended
	Roundtable Discussion on the Education Needs of Deaf and	Session 2:
	Hard of Hearing Students	Mr. Brendan Lennon, Director of
		Advocacy, Chime
		Dr. John Bosco Conama, Vice-
		Chairperson, Irish Deaf Society (IDS)
		Holy Family School for the Deaf
		Ms. Eimear O'Rourke, Principal
		Mr. Shane Hamilton, Fifth-year pupil
J110 12/07/23	Private Session	N/A
J111 26/09/23	Private Session	N/A
J112 03/10/23	Briefing on Current and Future Plans of the School Building Unit	Mr. Hubert Loftus, Assistant Secretary, Head of the Planning & Building Unit, DE
		Ms Aine Cusack, Principal Officer, DE
		Mr Murty Hanly, Principal Officer, DE
		Mr Mark Kelly, Technical Manager, DE
		Ms Martina Mannion, Head of Special Education & Inclusion, DE
		Mr Martin McLoughlin, Principal Officer, DE
J113 17/10/23	Private Session	N/A

Meeting No. and Date	Торіс	Organisations, Groups and Individuals who attended
	Pre Legislative Scrutiny of the	Mr Patrick Rodgers, FRÉA- North of
	Education (Supports for Survivors of Residential Institutional Abuse)	England
	Bill 2023.	Ms Maeve Lewis, CEO, One in Four;
		Ms. Siobhan Byrne, Regional Outreach
		Officer, Right of Place-Second Chance
		Ms Carmel McDonnell Byrne, Board
		Member and Co Founder, Christine
		Buckley Centre for Education and
		Support.
J114 18/10/23	Pre Legislative Scrutiny, of the Education (Supports for Survivors of Residential Institutional Abuse)	Ms Aoife Conduit, Assistant Secretary, DE
	Bill 2023	Mr. Brian Power, Principal Officer, DE
		Mr Hugh Geoghegan, Assistant Principal Officer, DE
J115 25/10/23	Private Session	N/A

Meeting No. and Date	Торіс	Organisations, Groups and Individuals who attended
	Briefing on the Public Service Performance Report and the Public Service Performance Indicators for the Department of Education.	Session 1:
		Department of Education:
		Mr. Gavan O'Leary, Assistant Secretary
		Mr. Tom Whelan, Principal Officer, Finance Unit
		Dr. Paul Alexander, Senior Statistician, Statistics Unit
		Ms. Valerie Kirwan, Principal Officer, Planning and Building Unit (Finance area)
		Ms. Anne Murray, Principal Officer, Public Service Reform Programme Office
		Mr Padraig MacFhlannachadha, Assistant Chief Inspector
		Session 2:
		Department of Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science:
		Dr. Deirdre Lillis, Assistant Secretary General
		Ms Fiona O'Byrne, Principal Officer
		Ms Sarah Miley, Principal Officer
		Ms Trudy Duffy, Principal Officer
		Mr Paddy Howard, Principal Officer
		Ms Mary McGarry, Principal Officer
J116 07/11/23	Private Session	N/A

Meeting No. and Date	Торіс	Organisations, Groups and Individuals who attended
J116 07/11/23	Consent Programmes in Irish Education	Active Consent Programme (Other) Ms Eve McDowell, Advocacy Specialist
		Dr. Pádraig MacNeela, Senior Lecturer, School of Psychology, University of Galway
		Ms Sinéad MacGrath, Outreach specialist
		Dr. Siobhán O'Higgins, Co-Lead, Active Consent Programme
		<i>UCC Bystander Intervention</i> <i>Programme (Other)</i> Ms Celine Griffin, Bystander Intervention Manager
		Professor Louise Crowley, Director
J117 21/11/23	Private Session	N/A
J118 05/11/23	Cancelled	N/A
J119 12/12/23	Private Session	N/A

## **APPENDIX 4: Minutes of Proceedings of the Joint Committee**

## JOINT COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION, FURTHER AND HIGHER EDUCATION, RESEARCH, INNOVATION AND SCIENCE.

#### MINUTES OF MEETING OF 24 JANUARY 2023

The Joint Committee met in private session at 11:04 a.m. in CR2 LH2000, a quorum being present.

#### ATTENDANCE

The following Members were present:

**Deputies:** Paul Kehoe (in the Chair), Rose Conway-Walsh, Cathal Crowe, Jim O'Callaghan, Marc O Cathasaigh, Aodhán Ó Ríordáin and Pádraig O'Sullivan.

Senators: Aisling Dolan, Eileen Flynn, Rónán Mullen and Pauline O'Reilly.

#### **Private Session**

ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE SESSION ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE SESSION

#### ADJOURNMENT

The Committee adjourned at 11:28 am until 11.00 am on Tuesday, 31 January, in Public Session.

Mr Paul Kehoe TD

Cathaoirleach,

31 January 2023

Page 37 of 115

#### MINUTES OF MEETING OF 31 JANUARY 2023

The Joint Committee met in public session at 11.11 a.m.in CR2, a quorum being present.

#### ATTENDANCE

The following Members were present:

**Deputies:** Paul Kehoe (in the Chair), Rose Conway-Walsh, Cathal Crowe, Carol Nolan, Jim O'Callaghan, Pádraig O'Sullivan, Donnchadh Ó Laoghaire & Marc Ó Cathasaigh

Senators: Aisling Dolan. Eileen Flynn and Pauline O'Reilly

Apologies were received Senator Fiona O'Loughlin.

Deputies James O'Connor, Thomas Gould, Réada Cronin and Senator Micheál Carrigy

attended as non-Committee members.

#### Public Session

#### MINUTES OF THE MEETINGS ON 24 JANUARY 2023

The Minutes of the meetings held on 24 January 2023 were agreed.

#### COMM (2022) 526

It was agreed that that COM (2022) 526 Proposal for a DECISION OF THE EUROPEAN

PARLIAMENT AND OF THE COUNCIL on a European Year of Skills 2023 warrants no

further scrutiny as already decided in private session on 13 December 2022.

# MEETING WITH OFFICIALS FROM SCHOOL BUILDING UNIT, DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION

The Cathaoirleach welcomed:

- Mr. Hubert Loftus, Assistant Secretary, Head of Planning & Building Unit
- Ms. Martina Mannion, Assistant Secretary, Head of Inclusion Division
- Ms Áine Cusack, Principal Officer, Schools Capital Appraisal Section
- Mr John Dolan, Technical Manager with lead responsibility for Climate strategy for decarbonisation of School Buildings

- Mr Brendan Doody, Principal Officer, Special Education Section
- Mr Martin McLoughlin, Principal Officer, Special Education Section

This was followed by a question and answer session with the Members.

The Cathaoirleach thanked the Officials for an informative briefing which was very beneficial.

#### ANY OTHER BUSINESS

#### ADJOURNMENT

The Committee adjourned at 14.04pm until 11.00 am on Tuesday, 14 February 2023 in private and then Public session.

al the

Mr Paul Kehoe TD Cathaoirleach, 14 February 2023

Page 39 of 115

#### MINUTES OF MEETING OF 14 FEBRUARY 2023

The Joint Committee met in private session at 11.05 a.m. in CR2, a quorum being present.

#### ATTENDANCE

The following Members were present:

**Deputies:** Paul Kehoe *(in the Chair)*, Rose Conway-Walsh, Jim O'Callaghan and Carol Nolan.

Senators: Eileen Flynn and Pauline O Reilly.

Senator Martin Conway also attended the meeting.

#### Private Session

ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE SESSION ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE SESSION ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE SESSION

The Committee suspended from 11.13 am until 11.15 am to let the witnesses take their seats.

#### **Public Session**

#### MEETING WITH RELEVANT OFFICIALS AND UNIONS

#### Session 1

The Cathaoirleach welcomed:

- Ms Heather Cousins, Deputy Secretary, Skills and Education Group, Department for the Economy, Northern Ireland
- Mr Ian McKenna, Principal Officer, International Cooperation Unit, Department of Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science
- Dr Vivienne Patterson, Head of Skills, Engagement and Statistics, Higher Education Authority (HEA)

The Officials made Opening Statements on North South Enrolment in Tertiary Education.

This was followed by a question and answer session with Members.

The Cathaoirleach thanked the Officials for a briefing which was very beneficial.

The Committee suspended from 12:14 pm until 12:21 pm to allow the witnesses take their seats for session 2.

#### **SESSION 2**

The Cathaoirleach welcomed:

- Mr Frank Jones, General Secretary, The Irish Federation of University Teachers and representing Irish Congress of Trade Unions (ICTU)
- Mr. Colm Kelly, Assistant General Secretary, Teachers Union of Ireland (TUI)

The Cathaoirleach noted that University & College Union (UCU); Union of Students in Ireland (USI); National Union of Students (NUS)-Union of Students in Ireland (USI) and SIPTU were all invited but none could attend due to other important business.

National Union of Students (NUS)-Union of Students submitted a written statement that was uploaded on the Oireachtas website. USI contributed to the statement.

The witnesses made Opening Statements on North South Enrolment in Tertiary Education.

This was followed by a question and answer session with the Members.

The Cathaoirleach thanked the witnesses for a productive discussion which was very beneficial to the Committee.

#### ANY OTHER BUSINESS

The Committee adjourned at 12.54pm until Tuesday, 21 February 2023 in Public Session

1 100

Mr Paul Kehoe TD

Cathaoirleach,

21 February 2023

#### MINUTES OF MEETING OF 21 FEBRUARY 2023

The Joint Committee met in private session at 11.12 a.m. in CR2, a quorum being present.

#### ATTENDANCE

The following Members were present:

**Deputies:** Paul Kehoe *(in the Chair)*, Rose Conway-Walsh, Jim O'Callaghan, Donnchadh Ó Laoghaire and Aodhán Ó Ríordáin.

Senators: Eileen Flynn and Pauline O'Reilly

Apologies were received from Deputy Carol Nolan.

Deputy James Costello also attended the meeting.

#### Public Session

#### MINUTES OF THE MEETING ON 14 FEBRUARY 2023

The Minutes of the Meeting held on 14 February 2023 was agreed.

#### MEETING WITH REPRESENTATIVE GROUPS AND RELEVANT ORGANISATIONS

#### SESSION 1:

The Cathaoirleach welcomed:

- Professor Ciarán Ó hÓgartaigh, President, Universities Ireland.
- Mr. Paul Hannigan, Head of College, Atlantic Technological University (ATU) and representing Technological Higher Education Authority (THEA).
- Mr Lewis Purser, Director of Teaching, Learning & Academic Affairs, Irish Universities Association (IUA).

The witnesses made Opening Statements on North South Enrolment in Tertiary Education.

This was followed by a question and answer session with the Members.

The Cathaoirleach thanked the witnesses for a productive discussion which was very beneficial to the Committee.

#### PRIVATE SESSION

#### ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE SESSION

#### Public Session

#### SESSION 2:

The Cathaoirleach welcomed:

- Dr Anthony Soares, Director, Centre for Cross Border Studies
- Professor Gerry McKenna MRIA, Senior Vice President, Royal Irish Academy
- Mr Martin McKendry, College Director, College of Agriculture Food and Rural Enterprise (CAFRE)

The witnesses made Opening Statements on North South Enrolment in Tertiary Education.

This was followed by a question and answer session with the Members.

The Cathaoirleach thanked the witnesses for a productive discussion which was very beneficial to the Committee.

#### ANY OTHER BUSINESS

The Committee adjourned at 13.21pm until Tuesday, 28 February 2023 at 11 am in Private and then Public Session

C1 the

Mr Paul Kehoe TD

Cathaoirleach,

28 February 2023

#### MINUTES OF MEETING OF 28 FEBRUARY 2023

The Joint Committee met in private session at 11.13 a.m. in CR2, a quorum being present.

#### ATTENDANCE

The following Members were present:

**Deputies:** Paul Kehoe *(in the Chair)*, Rose Conway Walsh, Jim O' Callaghan, Carol Nolan and Cathal Crowe.

**Senators:** Pauline O'Reilly

#### **Private Session**

ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE SESSION ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE SESSION

#### Public Session

#### MINUTES OF THE MEETING ON 21<sup>ST</sup> FEBRUARY 2023

The Cathaoirleach welcomed:

- Mr John Irwin, General Secretary, Association of Community & Comprehensive Schools (ACCS)
- Mr John Curtis, General Secretary, Joint Managerial Body (JMB)
- Mr Martin Gormley, Director of Schools, Donegal Education and Training Board (DETB) representing Education and Training Boards Ireland (ETBI)

The witnesses made Opening Statements on the Future of Science, Technology, Engineering and Maths (STEM) in Irish Education.

This was followed by a question-and-answer session with the Members.

The Cathaoirleach thanked the witnesses for a productive discussion which was very beneficial to the Committee.

#### ANY OTHER BUSINESS

The Committee adjourned at 12.55pm until Tuesday, 7 March 2023 at 11 am Public Session.

Paul the

Mr Paul Kehoe TD Cathaoirleach,

7 March 2023

#### MINUTES OF MEETING OF 7 MARCH 2023

The Joint Committee met in private session at 11.09 a.m. in CR2, a quorum being present.

#### ATTENDANCE

The following Members were present:

Deputies: Paul Kehoe (in the Chair), Jim O'Callaghan and Pádraig O'Sullivan

Senators: Aisling Dolan

Apologies were received from Deputy Rose Conway-Walsh.

Senator Michéal Carrigy and Deputy Pauline Tully also attended the meeting.

#### PUBLIC SESSION

#### MINUTES OF THE MEETING ON 28TH FEBRUARY 2023

The Minutes of the Meeting held on 28<sup>th</sup> February 2023 was agreed.

#### MEETING WITH MANAGEMENT REPRESENTATIVE BODY (SESSION 1)

The Cathaoirleach welcomed Mr Paul Crone, Director, National Association for Principals and Deputy Principals.

This was followed by a question and answer session with the Members.

The Cathaoirleach thanked Mr Crone for a productive discussion which was very beneficial to the Committee.

#### **MEETING WITH RELEVANT UNIONS (SESSION 2)**

The Cathaoirleach welcomed:

- Mr Frank Jones, General Scretary, Irish Federation of University Teachers (IFUT)
- Ms Máirín Ní Chéileachair, Head of Education and Research/ Assistant General Secretary, Irish National Teachers' Organisation (INTO)
- Ms Moira Leydon, Assistant General Secretary, Education & Research, Association of Secondary Teachers Ireland (ASTI)
- Ms Caitlin Faye Maniti, President, Irish Second-Level Students' Union (ISSU)

- Ms Beth O'Reilly, President, Union of Students in Ireland (USI)
- Mr David Duffy, Education and Research Officer, Teachers Union of Ireland (TUI)

The witnesses made Opening Statements on the Future of Science, Technology, Engineering and Maths (STEM) in Irish Education.

This was followed by a question and answer session with the Members.

The Cathaoirleach thanked the witnesses for a productive discussion which was very beneficial to the Committee.

#### ANY OTHER BUSINESS

The Committee adjourned at 13:22 pm until Tuesday, 21 March 2023 at 11.00 am in Private and then Public Session.

Mr Paul Kehoe TD Cathaoirleach 21 March 2023

Page 47 of 115

#### MINUTES OF MEETING OF 21 MARCH 2023

The Joint Committee met in private session at 11.02 a.m. in CR2, a quorum being present.

#### ATTENDANCE

The following Members were present:

**Deputies:** Paul Kehoe *(in the Chair)*, Rose Conway-Walsh, Jim O'Callaghan and Marc Ó Cathasaigh.

Senators: Aisling Dolan and Pauline O'Reilly.

Apologies were received from Senators Eileen Flynn and Fiona O'Loughlin.

#### PRIVATE SESSION

ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE SESSION ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE SESSION ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE SESSION

The Committee suspended from 11.24 am until 11.25 am to allow the witnesses take their seats for session 1.

#### PUBLIC SESSION

#### MINUTES OF THE MEETING ON 7<sup>TH</sup> MARCH 2023

The Minutes of the Meeting held on 7<sup>th</sup> March 2023 were agreed.

#### **MEETING WITH POST PRIMARY TEACHER REPRESENTATIVE BODIES (SESSION 1)**

The Cathaoirleach welcomed:

- Mr Ciarán Duffy, Chairperson of National Council, Irish Maths Teachers' Association (IMTA)
- Mr Barry Convey, National Chairperson, Engineering Technology Teachers Association (ETTA)
- Mr Humphrey Jones, Vice Chairperson, Irish Science Teachers Association (ISTA)

The witnesses made Opening Statements on the Future of Science, Technology, Engineering and Maths (STEM) in Irish Education.

This was followed by a question and answer session with the Members.

The Cathaoirleach thanked the witnesses for a productive discussion which was very beneficial to the Committee.

The Committee suspended from 12:41 pm until 12:47 pm to allow the witnesses take their seats for session 2.

#### **MEETING WITH HIGHER EDUCATION REPRESENTATIVE BODIES (SESSION 2)**

The Cathaoirleach welcomed:

Professor Lisa Looney, Vice President for Academic Affairs and Registrar, Dublin City University (DCU), representing the Irish Universities Association (IUA)

Dr Maria Kyne, Dean of the Faculty of Engineering and the Built Environment, Technological University of the Shannon Midlands Midwest (TUS), representing the Technological Higher Education Authority (THEA)

Dr Mary Kelly, Academic Dean, Hibernia College, Higher Education Colleges Association (HECA)

The witnesses made Opening Statements on the Future of Science, Technology, Engineering and Maths (STEM) in Irish Education.

This was followed by a question and answer session with the Members.

The Cathaoirleach thanked the witnesses for a productive discussion which was very beneficial to the Committee.

#### **ANY OTHER BUSINESS**

The Committee adjourned at 13.54pm until 11.00 am on Tuesday, 28 March 2023 in Public Session

1 1

Mr Paul Kehoe TD

Cathaoirleach,

28 March 2023

Page 49 of 115

#### MINUTES OF MEETING OF 28 MARCH 2023

The Joint Committee met in public session at 11.14 a.m. in CR2, a quorum being present.

#### ATTENDANCE

The following Members were present:

**Deputies:** Paul Kehoe (in the Chair), Rose Conway-Walsh, Jim O'Callaghan, Carol Nolan and Marc Ó Cathasaigh.

Senators: Pauline O'Reilly, Eileen Flynn, Fiona O'Loughlin and Aisling Dolan

Deputy Jackie Cahill also attended the meeting.

#### PUBLIC SESSION

#### MINUTES OF THE MEETING ON 21ST MARCH 2023

The Minutes of the Meeting held on 21<sup>st</sup> March 2023 were agreed.

## MEETING WITH MR. THOMAS BYRNE, TD, MINISTER FOR SPORT AND PHYSICAL EDUCATION (SESSION 1)

The Chairman welcomed the Minister of State and his Officials.

He explained that the purpose of the meeting was to consider a Dáil and Seanad Motion: 'That Dáil and Seanad Éireann approves the Employment Equality Act 1998 (Section 12) (Reservation of Vocational Training Places) Order 2022'

Minister of State Byrne made an opening statement.

The Chair then stated, that 'in accordance with Dáil Standing Order 87 and Seanad Standing Order 75, the following message would be sent to the Clerks of the Dáil and Seanad:

The Joint Committee on Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science has completed its consideration of the following motion: That Dáil and Seanad Éireann approves the Employment Equality Act 1998 (Section 12) (Reservation of Vocational Training Places) Order 2022'

The Cathaoirleach suspended the meeting from 11.16 am until 11.21 to allow the witnesses take their seats.

#### MEETING WITH OTHER RELEVANT ORGANISATIONS (SESSION 2)

The Cathaoirleach welcomed:

- Dr Ruth Freeman, Director of Science for Society, Science Foundation Ireland (SFI).
- Mr Lee Reynolds, Head of Ireland & Northern Ireland, Institute of Physics (IOP)

The witnesses made Opening Statements on the Future of Science, Technology, Engineering and Maths (STEM) in Irish Education.

This was followed by a question and answer session with the Members.

The Cathaoirleach thanked the witnesses for a productive discussion which was very beneficial to the Committee.

The Committee suspended from 12.09pm until 12.14pm to allow the witnesses take their seats for session 3.

#### **MEETING WITH OTHER RELEVANT ORGANISATIONS (SESSION 3)**

The Cathaoirleach welcomed:

- Ms. Claire McGee, Head of Education and Innovation Policy, Irish Business and Economic Confederation (IBEC).
- Ms. Helen McMahon, Senior Strategy Policy Advisor, Enterprise Ireland (EI).
- Mr Neil McDonnell, Chief Executive, Irish Small and Medium Enterprises (ISM).
- Dr Aisling Soden, Project Manager, Talent Transformation and Innovation Department, Industrial Development Authority (IDA) Ireland.
- Mr. Michael Fitzgerald, Technical Training & Development Manager, ESB Networks, Electricity Supply Board (ESB).

The witnesses made Opening Statements on the Future of Science, Technology, Engineering and Maths (STEM) in Irish Education. This was followed by a question and answer session with the Members.

The Cathaoirleach thanked the witnesses for a productive discussion which was very beneficial to the Committee.

#### ANY OTHER BUSINESS

Page 51 of 115

The Committee adjourned at 1.41 pm until Tuesday, 18 April 2023 in Private and then Public Session.

Paul tela

Mr Paul Kehoe TD

Cathaoirleach,

18 April 2023

#### MINUTES OF MEETING OF 18 APRIL 2023

The Joint Committee met in private session at 11.05am in CR2, a quorum being present.

#### ATTENDANCE

The following Members were present:

**Deputies:** Paul Kehoe (in the Chair), Jim O'Callaghan, Sorca Clarke (in substitution for Donnchadh Ó Laoghaire), Mairéad Farrell (in substitution for Rose Conway Walsh) and Cathal Crowe

Senators: Eileen Flynn, Fiona O'Loughlin, Rónán Mullen and Pauline O'Reilly.

Deputy Mattie McGrath and Senators Maria Byrne and Malcolm Byrne also attended.

Apologies were received from Senator Aisling Dolan

#### PRIVATE SESSION

ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE SESSION ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE SESSION ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE SESSION

The Committee suspended from 11.12 a.m until 11.13 a.m to let the witnesses take their seats for session 1.

#### PUBLIC SESSION

#### MINUTES OF THE MEETING ON 28<sup>TH</sup> MARCH 2023

The Minutes of the Meeting held on 28<sup>th</sup> March 2023 were agreed.

#### MEETING WITH RELEVANT ACADEMICS, STUDENTS AND APPRENTICES

Session 1:

The Cathaoirleach welcomed:

- Dr Cornelia Connolly, Associate Professor, School of Education, College of Arts, Social Sciences & Celtic Studies, University of Galway.
- Dr. Ann Marcus-Quinn, Lecturer in Technical Communication and Instructional Design, University of Limerick (UL).

Page 53 of 115

- Professor Sarah McCormack, Professor of Energy Engineering, Department of Civil, Structural and Environmental Engineering, Trinity College Dublin.
- Professor Hamsa Venkat, Professor of STEM Education for Primary and Early Childhood Education, Institute of Education, DCU.
- Professor Hamsa Venkat, Professor of STEM Education for Primary and Early Childhood Education, Institute of Education, DCU.
- Dr Margaret Leahy, Head of the School of STEM Education, Innovation & Global Studies, Institute of Education, Dublin City University (DCU).
- Dr Áine Hyland, Emeritus Professor of Education, University College Cork (UCC)

The witnesses made Opening Statements on the Future of Science, Technology, Engineering and Maths (STEM) in Irish Education Education.

This was followed by a question and answer session with the Members.

The Cathaoirleach thanked the witnesses for a productive discussion which was very beneficial to the Committee.

The Committee suspended from 12.41 pm until 12.45 pm to allow the witnesses take their seats for session 2.

#### **SESSION 2**

The Cathaoirleach welcomed:

- Mr Shane O'Connor and Mr Liam Carew, 2023 Young Scientists of the Year
- Mr Jamie Bermingham, Plumbing Apprentice and Mr Martin Scattergood, Sheet Metal Work Apprentice, Worldskills.

The witnesses made Opening Statements on the Future of Science, Technology, Engineering and Maths (STEM) in Irish Education Education.

This was followed by a question and answer session with the Members.

The Cathaoirleach thanked the witnesses for a productive discussion which was very beneficial to the Committee.

#### 9. ANY OTHER BUSINESS

The Committee adjourned at 13.46 pm until Tuesday, 25 April 2023 at 11.00 am in Public Session.

Mr Paul Kehoe TD

Cathaoirleach,

25 April 2023

#### MINUTES OF MEETING OF 25 APRIL 2023

The Joint Committee met in private session at 11.09 a.m.in CR2, a quorum being present.

#### ATTENDANCE

The following Members were present:

**Deputies:** Paul Kehoe (in the Chair), Mairéad Farrell (in substitution for Rose Conway Walsh) and Pádraig O'Sullivan.

**Senators:** Deputy Aodhan Ó'Riordáin and Senators Aisling Dolan, Fiona O' Loughlin and Eileen Flynn.

Deputy Pat Buckley and Senator Micheál Carrigy also attended the meeting

#### PUBLIC SESSION

#### MINUTES OF THE MEETING ON 18<sup>TH</sup> MARCH 2023

The Minutes of the Meeting held on 18<sup>th</sup> March 2023 were agreed

#### **MEETING WITH STATUTORY ORGANISATIONS**

#### **SESSION 1**

The Cathaoirleach welcomed:

- Ms Evelyn O'Connor, Principal Officer, Curriculum and Assessment Policy Unit, Department of Education.
- Ms Karen Murtagh, Assistant Principal, Curriculum and Assessment Policy Unit, Department of Education.
- Ms Arlene Forster, Chief Executive, National Council for Curriculum and Assessment (NCCA).
- Mr Diarmuid Mooney, Acting Director, Curriculum and Assessment, NCCA.
- Ms Andrea Feeney, Chief Executive Officer, State Examinations Commission (SEC)
- Ms Elaine Sheridan, Head of Examinations and Assessment, SEC.

The Officials made Opening Statements on the Future of STEM in Irish Education.

This was followed by a question and answer session with the Members.

The Cathaoirleach thanked the officials for a productive briefing which was very beneficial to the Committee.

The Cathaoirleach suspended the meeting from 12.24 pm until 12.27 pm to allow the witnesses to take their seats.

#### PUBLIC SESSION

#### **SESSION 2**

The Cathaoirleach welcomed:

- Dr Mary-Liz Trant, Director, National Apprenticeship Office.
- Mr Andrew Brownlee, Chief Executive Officer, SOLAS.
- Dr. Peter Cullen, Head of Research and Innovation, Quality and Qualifications Ireland (QQI).
- Dr Vivienne Patterson, Head of Skills, Engagement and Statistics, Higher Education Authority (HEA).
- Mr Paddy Howard, Principal Officer, Innovation, Research Organisations and Programmes Department of Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science.

The Officials made Opening Statements on North South Enrolment in Tertiary Education.

This was followed by a question-and-answer session with the Members.

The Cathaoirleach thanked the officials for a productive briefing which was very beneficial to the Committee.

#### ANY OTHER BUSINESS

The Committee adjourned at 13.33 pm until Tuesday, 6 May 2023 at 11 am in Private and then Public Session.

Mr Paul Kehoe TD

Cathaoirleach

9 May 2023

#### MINUTES OF MEETING OF 9 MAY 2023

The Joint Committee met in Public session at 11.01 a.m. in CR2, a quorum being present.

#### ATTENDANCE

The following Members were present:

**Deputies:** Paul Kehoe *(in the Chair)*, Sorca Clarke, Jim O'Callaghan, Marc Ó Cathasaigh, Aodhán Ó Ríordáin, Carol Nolan and Pádraig O'Sullivan.

Senators: Pauline O'Reilly, Fiona O'Loughlin, and Eileen Flynn

Apologies were received from Deputies Alan Farrell, and Senator Fiona O'Loughlin.

Apologies were received from Deputy Mairéad Farrell

#### Private Session

ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE SESSION ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE SESSION ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE SESSION ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE SESSION

#### **Public Session**

#### MINUTES OF THE MEETING ON 28<sup>TH</sup> MARCH 2023

The Minutes of the Meeting held on 28<sup>th</sup> March 2023 were agreed.

#### **MEETING WITH REPRESENTATIVE BODIES (SESSION 1)**

The Cathaoirleach welcomed

- Dr Lisa Keating, Director of Research and Innovation, Irish Universities Association (IUA).
- Professor Willie Donnelly, Director, Research, Development and Innovation, Technological Higher Education Association (THEA)
- Professor Diarmaid Hegarty, Chair, Higher Education Colleges Association (HECA).

The witnesses made Opening Statements regarding PLS of the Research and Innovation Bill, 2023.

Page 57 of 115

This was followed by a question-and-answer session with the Members.

The Cathaoirleach thanked the witnesses for a productive discussion which was very beneficial to the Committee.

#### **MEETING WITH RELEVANT UNIONS (SESSION 2)**

The Cathaoirleach welcomed:

- Mr Frank Jones, Spokesperson, Irish Congress of Trade Unions (ICTU)
- Dr John Walsh, Trinity Convenor, Irish Federation of University Teachers (IFUT)
- Dr Richard Vance, Chair, Irish Research Staff Association (IRSA)
- Mr. Waqar Ahmed, Vice President, Postgraduate Affairs, Union of Students in Ireland (USI)
- Ms Annette Dolan, Deputy General Secretary, Teachers Union of Ireland (TUI)

The witnesses made Opening Statements regarding PLS of the Research and Innovation Bill, 2023.

This was followed by a question-and-answer session with the Members.

The Cathaoirleach thanked the witnesses for a productive discussion which was very beneficial to the Committee.

#### ANY OTHER BUSINESS

The Committee adjourned at 13.35 pm until Tuesday, 16 May 2023 at 11.00 am in Public Session.

Mr Paul Kehoe TD

Cathaoirleach

16 May 2023

#### MINUTES OF MEETING OF 16 MAY 2023

The Joint Committee met in private session at 11.06 a.m. in CR2, a quorum being present.

#### ATTENDANCE

The following Members were present:

**Deputies:** Sorca Clarke, Jim O'Callaghan and Aodhán Ó'Riordáin.

**Senators:** Aisling Dolan (in the Chair), Alice-Mary Higgins (in substitution for Eileen Flynn) and Pauline O'Reilly.

Apologies were received from Deputy Mairéad Farrell and Senator Fiona O'Loughlin.

Deputy Christopher O'Sullivan was also present

#### PRIVATE SESSION

#### ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE SESSION

The Committee suspended from 11.06 am until 11.07 am to let the witnesses take their seats for session 1.

#### PUBLIC SESSION

#### MINUTES OF THE MEETING ON 9 MAY 2023

The Minutes of the Meeting held on 9 May 2023 were agreed.

#### **MEETING WITH REPRESENTATIVE GROUPS AND RELEVANT ORGANISATIONS**

#### **SESSION 1**

The Cathaoirleach welcomed:

- Professor Daniel Carey, Chair of Board, Irish Research Council (IRC)
- Professor Philip Nolan, Director General, Science Foundation Ireland (SFI).
- Mr Tim Conlon, Head of Policy and Strategic Planning, Higher Education Authority (HEA)
- Dr Deirdre Lillis, Assistant Secretary General, Department of Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science (DFHERIS)

The witnesses made Opening Statements regarding Pre Legislative Scrutiny on the General

Page 59 of 115

Scheme of the Research and Innovation Bill, 2023.

This was followed by a question-and-answer session with the Members.

The Cathaoirleach thanked the witnesses for a productive discussion which was very beneficial to the Committee.

The Committee suspended from 12.31 pm until 12.34 pm to allow the witnesses take their seats for session 2.

#### **SESSION 2**

The Cathaoirleach welcomed:

- Professor Cormac Taylor, Professor of Cellular Physiology, Conway Institute, University College Dublin (UCD)
- Professor Helen Kelly-Holmes, Professor of Applied Languages, School of Modern Languages and Applied Linguistics, University of Limerick (UL)
- Professor Jim Livesey, Vice President Research & Innovation, University of Galway (UG)

The witnesses made Opening Statements on Pre Legislative Scrutiny on the General Scheme of the Research and Innovation Bill, 2023.

This was followed by a question-and-answer session with the Members.

The Cathaoirleach thanked the witnesses for a productive discussion which was very beneficial to the Committee.

#### **ANY OTHER BUSINESS**

The Committee adjourned at 13.53 pm until Tuesday, 23rd May 2023 at 11.00 am in Private and then Public Session.

Mr Paul Kehoe TD Cathaoirleach

23 May 2023

#### MINUTES OF MEETING OF 23 MAY 2023

The Joint Committee met in Public session at 11.01 a.m. in CR2, a quorum being present.

#### ATTENDANCE

The following Members were present:

**Deputies:** Jim O'Callaghan, Sorca Clarke, Aodhán Ó Ríordáin, Mairead Farrell and Padraig O'Sullivan.

**Senators:** Fiona O' Loughlin and Eileen Flynn

Apologies were received from Deputy Paul Kehoe.

Deputies: Darren O'Rourke and Bríd Smith was also present.

Senator: Malcolm Byrne and Mark Daly was also present.

#### Private Session

ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE SESSION ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE SESSION ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE SESSION

#### Public Session

#### MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF 9<sup>TH</sup> MAY 2023

The Minutes of the Meeting held on 9<sup>th</sup> May 2023 were agreed.

#### MEETING WITH THE NATIONAL COUNCIL FOR THE BLIND IN IRELAND (NCBI) (SESSION 1)

The Temporary Cathaoirleach welcomed the following witnesses from the National Council for the Blind in Ireland (NCBI):

- Mr Aaron Mullaniff, NCBI Chief Services Officer
- Ms Toni O'Dwyer, Manager, NCBI Children & Young People (CYP) Service
- Ms Edel Doherty, Senior Practitioner, NCBI CYP Team
- Mr Mullaniff made an Opening Statement on the education needs of visually impaired students.

This was followed by a question-and-answer session with the Members.

Page 61 of 115

The Temporary Cathaoirleach thanked the witnesses for a productive discussion.

The Committee suspended from 12:19pm until 12:21pm to allow the witness to take his seat for session 2

#### **MEETING WITH A RELEVANT INDIVIDUAL (SESSION 2)**

The Temporary Cathaoirleach welcomed Mr Andrew Geary.

The witness made an Opening Statement on education needs of deaf and hard of hearing students.

This was followed by a question-and-answer session with the Members.

The Temporary Cathaoirleach thanked the witness for a productive discussion which was very beneficial to the Committee.

#### **ANY OTHER BUSINESS**

The Committee adjourned at 13:07pm until Tuesday, 30 May 2023 at 11:00 am in Public Session.

Senator Pauline O'Reilly

Temporary Cathaoirleach,

30 May 2023

#### MINUTES OF MEETING OF 30 MAY 2023

The Joint Committee met in private session at 11.08 am in CR2, a quorum being present.

#### ATTENDANCE

The following Members were present:

**Deputies:** Mairéad Farrell, Jim O'Callaghan, Paul Kehoe (in the chair), Carol Nolan and Padraig O'Sullivan.

Senators: Eileen Flynn and Pauline O'Reilly.

Apologies were received from Deputy Marc Ó Cathasaigh and Senator Fiona O'Loughlin.

#### **Public Session**

#### MINUTES OF THE MEETING ON 23 MAY 2023

The Minutes of the Meeting held on 23 May 2023 were agreed

#### **MEETING WITH REPRESENTATIVE AND STATUTORY BODIES (SESSION 1)**

The Cathaoirleach welcomed the following Witnesses:

- Dr Padraig Walsh, Chief Executive. Quality and Qualifications Ireland (QQI)
- Ms Ginny Hanrahan, Chief Executive and Registrar, CORU
- Professor Orla Sheils, Vice-Provost and Chief Academic Officer of Trinity College representing the Irish Universities Association (IUA)
- Ms Mary McHugh, Technological University of the Shannon Midlands Mid West (TUS), representing Technological Higher Education Association (THEA)
- Ms Patricia O'Sullivan, Executive Director, Higher Education Colleges Association (HECA)

The witnesses made Opening Statements on the Professional Accreditation of Higher Education (HE) courses with specific reference to Health and Social Care Professions.

This was followed by a question-and-answer session with the Members.

The Cathaoirleach thanked the witnesses for a productive discussion.

Page 63 of 115

The Committee suspended from 12:19 pm until 12:25 pm to allow the officials to take their seats for session 2.

#### MEETING WITH OFFICIALS FROM THE DEPARTMENT OF FURTHER AND HIGHER EDUCATION, RESEARCH, INNOVATION AND SCIENCE (SESSION 2)

The Cathaoirleach welcomed the following officials:

- Ms Tanya Kenny, Principal Officer and Ms Fiona O'Byrne, Principal Officer from the Department of Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science to the meeting.
- Ms O'Byrne made an Opening Statement on the Professional Accreditation of Higher Education (HE) courses with specific reference to Health and Social Care Professions.

This was followed by a question-and-answer session with the Members.

The Cathaoirleach thanked the Officials for the briefing which was very beneficial to the Committee.

#### ANY OTHER BUSINESS

The Committee adjourned at 12:50 pm until Tuesday, 13 June 2023 at 11:00 am in Private and then Public Session.

1 th

Mr Paul Kehoe TD

Cathaoirleach

21 June 2023

#### MINUTES OF MEETING OF 21 JUNE 2023

The Joint Committee met in private session at 5.10 pin CR2, a quorum being present.

#### ATTENDANCE

The following Members were present:

**Deputies:** Paul Kehoe (in the Chair), Sorca Clarke, Cathal Crowe, Carol Nolan, Jim O'Callaghan, Pádraig O'Sullivan & Aodhán Ó'Riordáin.

Senator Aisling Dolan.

Apologies were received from Deputies Alan Farrell, and Senators Eileen Flynn, Rónán Mullen and Fiona O'Loughlin.

Senator Malcolm Byrne substituted for Senator Fiona O'Loughlin.

#### Private Session

ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE SESSION ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE SESSION ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE SESSION ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE SESSION

#### Public Session

#### MINUTES OF THE MEETING ON 30<sup>TH</sup> MAY 2023

The Minutes of the Meeting held on 30<sup>th</sup> May 2023 were agreed.

#### MEETING WITH MINISTER SIMON HARRIS

#### SESSION 1

The Cathaoirleach welcomed Minister Harris and his Officials.

The Minister made an Opening Statement on the Motion: That Dáil Éireann and Seanad Éireann approves the Technological University Act 2018 (Section 44F) (Appointed Day) Order 2023.

It was agreed, in accordance with Dáil Standing Order 87 and Seanad Standing Order 75, the following message will be sent to the Clerks of the Dáil and Seanad:

The Joint Committee on Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science has completed its consideration of the following motion: That Dáil and Seanad Éireann approves the Technological University Act 2018 (Section 44F) (Appointed Day) Order 2023

#### SESSION 1

The Minister made an Opening Statement on the following key issues:

- Key Recommendations in the Future Funding of Higher Education Report
- Student Accommodation/UCD Student Union's Report
- Improved public transport to enable students to commute from home county to college
- Need for additional courses in veterinary surgery and other professions with graduate shortages
- Academic Employment Precarity
- National Review of State Supports for PhD Researchers
- Student Contribution Fee for 2023/24
- Plans for the National Training Fund (NTF) and the 2023 European Year of Skills

This was followed by a questions and answers session with the Members.

The Cathaoirleach thanked the Minister and his Officials for a productive engagement.

#### ANY OTHER BUSINESS

The Committee adjourned at 7.45 pm until Tuesday, 27 June 2023 at 11.00 am when the Select Committee will meet in Public Session.

P. 1 to

Mr Paul Kehoe TD

Cathaoirleach,

4 July 2023

#### MINUTES OF MEETING OF 4<sup>TH</sup> JULY 2023

The Joint Committee met in private session at 11.01 am in CR2, a quorum being present.

#### ATTENDANCE

The following Members were present:

**Deputies:** Sorca Clarke, Mairéad Farrell, Paul Kehoe (in the Chair), Carol Nolan, Jim O'Callaghan, Marc Ó'Cathasaigh, Aodhán Ó'Riordáin and Pádraig O'Sullivan

Senators: Eileen Flynn and Fiona O'Loughlin

Apologies were received from Senator Pauline O'Reilly.

#### Public Session

#### MINUTES OF THE MEETING ON 21<sup>st</sup> JUNE 2023

The Minutes of the Meeting held on 21<sup>st</sup> June 2023 were agreed.

#### MEETING WITH REPRESENTATIVE GROUPS AND THE DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION

#### **SESSION 1**

The Cathaoirleach welcomed:

- Mr Brendan Lennon, Director of Advocacy, CHIME, Irish Deaf Society (IDS)
- Dr. John Bosco Conama, Vice Chair, Board of Directors, Irish Deaf Society (IDS)
- Ms Eimear O'Rourke, Principal, Holy Family School for the Deaf, Cabra, Dublin 7
- Mr Shane Hamilton, 5th Year student, Holy Family School for the Deaf, Cabra, Dublin
  7.

The witnesses made Opening Statements on the education needs of deaf and hard of hearing students.

This was followed by a question and answer session with the Members.

The Cathaoirleach thanked the witnesses for a productive discussion which was very beneficial to the Committee.

Page 67 of 115

#### SESSION 2

The Cathaoirleach welcomed:

- Ms Martina Mannion, Assistant Secretary with responsibility for Special Education and Inclusion
- Mr. Brendan Doody, Principal Officer, Special Education Unit
- Mr. Frank Hanlon, Principal Officer, Special Education Unit
- Mr Kieran Rogers, Assistant Principal Officer, Special Education Unit
- Ms Evelyn O'Connor, Principal Officer, Curriculum and Assessment Unit
- Mr Mark Kelly, Technical Manager, Planning and Building Unit

Ms Mannion made an Opening Statement on the education needs of deaf and hard of hearing students.

This was followed by a question and answer session with the Members.

The Cathaoirleach thanked the officials for an informative briefing which was very beneficial to the Committee.

#### **ANY OTHER BUSINESS**

The Committee adjourned at 1.15 pm until Wednesday,12 July 2023 at 5.00 pm in Private Session.

al the

Mr Paul Kehoe TD

Cathaoirleach

12 July 2023

#### MINUTES OF MEETING OF 12 JULY 2023

The Joint Committee met in private session at 17.03pm in CR4, a quorum being present.

#### ATTENDANCE

The following Members were present:

Deputies: Sorca Clarke, Paul Kehoe (in the chair), Mairéad Farrell

Senators: Pauline O'Reilly, Eileen Flynn and Fiona O'Loughlin

Apologies were received from Deputy Aodhán Ó'Riordáin, Senators Aisling Dolan and Rónán Mullen

#### **PRIVATE SESSION**

ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE SESSION ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE SESSION

#### **ANY OTHER BUSINESS**

The Committee adjourned at 17:27 pm until Tuesday, 26 September 2023 at 11.00 am in Private Session.

1\_1

Mr Paul Kehoe TD

Cathaoirleach

26 September 2023

Page 69 of 115

#### MINUTES OF MEETING OF 26<sup>™</sup> SEPTEMBER 2023

The Joint Committee met in private session at 11:05 am in CR2, a quorum being present.

#### ATTENDANCE

The following Members were present:

**Deputies:** Paul Kehoe *(in the Chair),* Carol Nolan, Jim O'Callaghan, Marc Ó Cathasaigh Donnchadh Ó Laoghaire and Pádraig O'Sullivan

Senators: Aisling Dolan, Eileen Flynn and Pauline O' Reilly

Apologies were received from Deputy Rose Conway-Walsh and Senator Fiona O'Loughlin.

#### PRIVATE SESSION

ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE SESSION ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE SESSION ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE SESSION

#### **ANY OTHER BUSINESS**

The Committee adjourned at 11:36 am until 11.00 am on Tuesday, 3 October in Public Session.

C1 \_\_\_\_\_

Mr Paul Kehoe TD

Cathaoirleach

3 October 2023

# JOINT COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION, FURTHER AND HIGHER EDUCATION, RESEARCH, INNOVATION AND SCIENCE

#### MINUTES OF MEETING OF 3 OCTOBER 2023

The Joint Committee met in private session at 11.02 am in CR2, a quorum being present.

#### ATTENDANCE

The following Members were present:

**Deputies:** Sorca Clarke, Paul Kehoe (*in the Chair*), Mairéad Farrell, Carol Nolan, Marc O'Cathasaigh, Aodhán Ó'Ríordáin and Pádraig O'Sullivan

Senators. Aisling Dolan, Eileen Flynn, Fiona O'Loughlin and Pauline O'Reilly.

Deputies Patrick Costello, Alan Dillon and Jennifer Whitmore were also in attendance.

#### **PUBLIC SESSION**

#### MINUTES OF THE MEETING ON 26TH SEPTEMBER 2023

The Minutes of the Meeting held on 26<sup>th</sup> September 2023 were agreed.

Meeting with Department of Education officials.

The Cathaoirleach welcomed:

- Mr Hubert Loftus, Assistant Secretary, Planning and Building Unit
- Mr Murty Hanly, Principal Officer, Planning and Building Unit
- Ms Áine Cusack, Principal Officer, Planning and Building Unit
- Mr Mark Kelly, Technical Manager, Planning and Building Unit
- Ms Martina Mannion, Assistant Secretary, Special Education
- Mr Martin McLoughlin, Principal Officer, Special Education

Mr Loftus made an Opening Statement on Current and Future Plans of the School Building Unit with specific reference to:

- 1. New School Building for the Holy Family School for the Deaf, Cabra, Dublin 7
- 2. Progress in providing ASD units in Primary Schools
- 3. New and Replacement Secondary Schools
- 4. Conversion of existing accommodation for autism classes.
- 5. General overview of new modular builds and their intended duration.
- 6. Sports facilities, halls and multi purpose rooms.
- 7. Department of Education involvement in school car parking and traffic management solutions.
- 8. Siting of Schools in terms of Transport and Mobility Issues
- 9. Current and Future Climate Action Plans, including the siting of schools in relation to transport emissions.

Page 71 of 115

10. Exact placement of school extension / pre fab buildings within the footprint of the school grounds and prioritisation / conservation of recreational and sports facilities

This was followed by a question and answer session with the Members.

Deputy Sorca Clarke was elected as Temporary Cathaoirleach at 13:13 p.m. following a proposal by Mr Paul Kehoe TD that was seconded by Mr. Alan Dillon TD.

It was agreed that the Cathaoirleach will write to the Secretary General, Department of Education stating that Members raised concerns regarding the responses to written Parliamentary Questions provided by the School Building Unit. Specifically, regarding the general accuracy, quality and transparency of the responses received. A response from the Secretary General to the concerns will be requested.

It was also agreed that the Cathaoirleach will write to the Ceann Comhairle stating that Members raised concerns regarding the responses to written Parliamentary Questions provided by the School Building Unit. Specifically, regarding the general accuracy, quality and transparency of the responses received. It will seek the number of Parliamentary Questions, if any, from the Department of Education, which were referred to the Ceann Comhairle by Members for review, because of dissatisfaction with the general accuracy, quality and transparency of the responses received.

The Cathaoirleach thanked the officials for an informative briefing which had been very beneficial to the Committee.

#### ANY OTHER BUSINESS

The Committee adjourned at 13:34 pm until Tuesday, 17 October 2023 at 11.00 am in Private and then Public Session.

Mr Paul Kehoe TD

Cathaoirleach

17 October 2023

# JOINT COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION, FURTHER AND HIGHER EDUCATION, RESEARCH, INNOVATION AND SCIENCE

#### MINUTES OF MEETING OF 17<sup>TH</sup> OCTOBER 2023

The Joint Committee met in private session at 11.00 am in CR2, a quorum being present.

#### ATTENDANCE

The following Members were present:

**Deputies:** Sorcha Clarke, Mairéad Farrell, Paul Kehoe (*in the Chair*), Jim O'Callaghanand Aodhán Ó'Riordáin

Senators: Fiona O'Loughlin.

Apologies were received from Deputies Cathal Crowe, Carol Nolan, Marc Ó'Cathasaigh and Senator Eileen Flynn.

Senator Lynn Boylan also attended the meeting.

#### PRIVATE SESSION

ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE SESSION ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE SESSION ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE SESSION ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE SESSION

#### **PUBLIC SESSION**

#### MINUTES OF THE MEETING ON 3RD OCTOBER 2023

The Minutes of the Meeting held on 3<sup>rd</sup> October 2023 were agreed.

#### EU SCRUTINY

It was agreed COM (2023) warrants no further scrutiny.

#### MEETING WITH REPRESENTATIVE GROUPS

The Cathaoirleach welcomed;

- Mr Patrick Rodgers, FRÉA- North of England
- Ms Maeve Lewis, CEO, One in Four;
- Ms. Siobhan Byrne, Regional Outreach Officer, Right of Place-Second Chance
- Ms Carmel McDonnell Byrne, Board Member and Co Founder, Christine Buckley Centre for Education and Support.

The witnesses made Opening Statements as part of the Pre Legislative Scrutiny of the Education (Supports for Survivors of Residential Institutional Abuse) Bill 2023.

It was agreed the Cathaoirleach will write to the Cathaoirleach of the Health Committee asking that Committee to examine the issue of funding for the Survivor Support Groups present at the meeting, excluding FRÉA, which is based in the UK. The letter will issue when a transcript of the proceedings is available.

#### ADJOURNMENT

The Committee adjourned at 12.42 pm until Wednesday, 18 October 2023 at 5.30 pm in Public Session.

Mr Paul Kehoe TD

Cathaoirleach

18 October 2023

# JOINT COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION, FURTHER AND HIGHER EDUCATION, RESEARCH, INNOVATION AND SCIENCE

#### MINUTES OF MEETING OF 18<sup>TH</sup> OCTOBER 2023

The Joint Committee met in private session at 17:35 pm in CR2, a quorum being present.

#### ATTENDANCE

The following Members were present:

Deputies: Paul Kehoe (in the Chair), Sorca Clarke, Jim O'Callaghan

Senator Tom Lombard (FG) attended the meeting

#### PUBLIC SESSION

#### MINUTES OF THE MEETING ON 17TH OCTOBER 2023

The Minutes of the Meeting held on 17<sup>th</sup> October 2023 were agreed.

MEETING WITH DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION OFFICIALS The Cathaoirleach welcomed:

- Ms. Aoife Conduit, Assistant Secretary
- Mr. Brian Power, Principal Officer
- Mr Hugh Geoghegan, Assistant Principal Officer

Ms Conduit made an Opening Statement, as part of the Pre-Legislative Scrutiny, of the Education (Supports for Survivors of Residential Instituional Abuse) Bill 2023

This was followed by a question and answer session with the Members

The Cathaoirleach thanked the officials for an informative briefing which had been very beneficial to the Committee.

#### **ANY OTHER BUSINESS**

The Committee adjourned at 6.20 pm until Wednesday, 25 October 2023 at 6.20 pm in Public Session.

Mr Paul Kehoe TD

Cathaoirleach

25 October 2023

Page 75 of 115

# JOINT COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION, FURTHER AND HIGHER EDUCATION, RESEARCH, INNOVATION AND SCIENCE

#### MINUTES OF MEETING OF 25 OCTOBER 2023

The Joint Committee met in private session at 11:06 am in CR2, a quorum being present.

#### ATTENDANCE

The following Members were present:

**Deputies:** Paul Kehoe *(in the Chair)*, Mairéad Farrell, Jim O'Callaghan, and Marc Ó'Cathasaigh

**Senator**: Eileen Flynn and Pauline O'Reilly (Temporarily in the Chair)

Deputy Martin Kenny also attended the meeting.

#### PRIVATE SESSION

ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE SESSION ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE SESSION

#### PUBLIC SESSION

#### **EU SCRUTINY**

It was agreed COM (2023) 502, a Proposal for a DIRECTIVE OF THE EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT AND OF THE COUNCIL regarding the recognition of professional qualifications of nurses responsible for general care trained in Romania warrants no further scrutiny.

# MEETING WITH DEPARTMENTS OF EDUCATION AND FURTHER AND HIGHER EDUCATION, RESEARCH, INNOVATION AND SCIENCE

#### **SESSION 1**

The Temporary Cathaoirleach welcomed:

- Mr. Gavan O'Leary, Assistant Secretary, DE
- Mr. Tom Whelan, Principal Officer, Finance Unit, DE
- Dr. Paul Alexander, Senior Statistician, Statistics Unit, DE
- Ms. Valerie Kirwan, Principal Officer, Planning and Building Unit (Finance area), DE
- Ms. Anne Murray, Principal Officer, Public Service Reform Programme Office, DE
- Mr Padraig MacFhlannachadha, Assistant Chief Inspector, DE

The Officials briefed the Committee on the Public Service Performance Report and the Public Service Performance Indicators for the Department of Education.

The Cathaoirleach resumed the chair at 11.58 am.

#### **SESSION 2**

The Cathaoirleach welcomed:

- Dr. Deirdre Lillis, Assistant Secretary General, DFHERIS
- Ms Fiona O'Byrne, Principal Officer, DFHERIS
- Ms Sarah Miley, Principal Officer, DFHERIS
- Ms Trudy Duffy, Principal Officer, DFHERIS
- Mr Paddy Howard, Principal Officer, DFHERIS
- Ms Mary McGarry, Principal Officer, DFHERIS

The Officials briefed the Committee on the Public Service Performance Report and the Public Service Performance Indicators for the Department of Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science.

#### ADJOURNMENT

The Committee adjourned at 1.25 pm until Tuesday, 7 November 2023 at 11.00 am in Private Session.

1 1

Mr Paul Kehoe TD

Cathaoirleach

7 November 2023

# Joint Committee on Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science.

#### Minutes of Meeting of 7<sup>th</sup> November 2023

The Joint Committee met in private session at 11.03 am in CR2, a quorum being present.

#### Attendance

The following Members were present:

**Deputies:** Paul Kehoe *(in the Chair)*, Mairéad Farrell, Marc Ó'Cathasaigh and Aodhán Ó'Riordáin

Senators: Eileen Flynn and Rónán Mullen

Private Session

ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE SESSION ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE SESSION ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE SESSION Public Session

#### MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF 25TH OCTOBER 2023

The Minutes of the Meeting held on 25th October 2023 were agreed.

Meeting with Representatives of the Active Consent Programme and the Bystander Intervention Programme

The Cathaoirleach welcomed:

- Dr Pádraig MacNeela, Senior Lecturer, School of Psychology, University of
- Galway.
- Ms Eve McDowell, Advocacy specialist, Active Consent programme.
- Ms Sinéad McGrath, Outreach specialist, Active Consent programme.
- Dr Siobhán O'Higgins, Co-Lead, Active Consent programme.
- Professor Louise Crowley, Professor of Law and Director, Bystander Intervention
- programme, University College Cork
- Ms Celine Griffin, Bystander Intervention Manager, University College Cork.

The witnesses made Opening Statements on Consent Programmes in Irish Education.

Deputy Mairéad Farrell was nominated by the Cathaoirleach as Temporary Cathaoirleach and took the Chair at 11.33 am having seconded the nomination.

The Cathaoirleach resumed the Chair at 11.45 pm.

The Cathaoirleach thanked the witnesses for sharing their expert knowledge and insights on an issue of great importance and commended them on their trojan work.

# Adjournment

The Committee adjourned at 12:40 pm until Tuesday, 21 November 2023 at 11:00 am in Private and then Public Session.

Paul thete

Mr Paul Kehoe TD Cathaoirleach, 21 November 2023

JOINT COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION, FURTHER AND HIGHER EDUCATION, RESEARCH, INNOVATION AND SCIENCE.

Page 79 of 115

#### MINUTES OF MEETING OF 21 NOVEMBER 2023

The Joint Committee met in public session at 12:04 pm in CR2, a quorum being present.

#### ATTENDANCE

The following Members were present:

Deputies: Paul Kehoe (in the Chair) and Mairéad Farrell

Senators: Aisling Dolan and Pauline O'Reilly

Apologies were received from Deputy Cathal Crowe and Senator Eileen Flynn

#### Public Session

ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE SESSION ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE SESSION ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE SESSION ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE SESSION

#### **ANY OTHER BUSINESS**

The Committee adjourned at 12:15 am until Tuesday, 5 December 2023 at 17.30 pm in Public Session.

al total

Mr Paul Kehoe TD

Cathaoirleach,

5 December 2023

# JOINT COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION, FURTHER AND HIGHER EDUCATION, RESEARCH, INNOVATION AND SCIENCE

#### MINUTES OF MEETING OF 12 DECEMBER 2023

The Joint Committee met in private session at 12.35 pm in CR2, a quorum being present.

#### ATTENDANCE

The following Members were present:

Deputies: Paul Kehoe (in the Chair), Sorca Clarke and Mairéad Farrell

Senators: Aisling Dolan and Rónán Mullen

Apologies were received from Senator Fiona O'Loughlin.

Private Session

ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE ITEM DISCUSSED IN PRIVATE

#### ADJOURNMENT

The Committee adjourned at 12.43 pm until Wednesday, 24 January at 5.30 pm in Private and Public Session.

al to

Mr Paul Kehoe TD

Cathaoirleach,

24 January 2024

# **APPENDIX 5: Meetings of the Dáil Select Committee**

The following are the details, in date order, of the scheduled meetings of the Select Committee which took place during the period under report.

Meeting No. and Date	Торіс	Organisations, Groups and Individuals who attended
S12.01/02/23	2023 Revised Estimates for Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science (Vote 45)	Mr. Niall Collins T.D., Minister of State for Skills and Further Education
S13 08/02/23	2023 Revised Estimates for Publin Services – Vote 26	Ms. Norma Foley TD, Minister for Education
S14 10/05/23	Consideration of the Education Bill 2020	Postponed
S15 27/06/23	Committee Stage consideration of the Construction Licensing Safety Bill 2023	Mr. Niall Collins T.D., Minister of State for Skills and Further Education
S16 28/11/23	2023 Supplementary Estimates for Public Services – Vote 45	Mr. Niall Collins T.D., Minister of State for Skills and Further Education
S17 29/11/23	2023 Supplementary Estimates for Public Services – Vote 26	Ms. Norma Foley TD, Minister for Education

# APPENDIX 6: Proceedings of the Select Committee (Imeachtaí)

# IMEACHTAÍ AN ROGHCHOISTE

**PROCEEDINGS OF THE SELECT COMMITTEE** 

Dé Céadaoin, 01 Feabhra 2023

Wednesday, 01 February 2023

1. Chruinnigh an Coiste ar 5.28 p.m.

2. Comhaltaí i Láthair

Bhí na comhaltaí seo a leanas i láthair:

An Teachta Pól Mac Eochaidh (*i* gCeannas), An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, (an tAire Stáit ag an Roinn Breisoideachais agus Ardoideachais, Taighde, Nuálaíochta agus Eolaíochta), na Teachtaí Rós. Ní Chonnmhacháin-Breathnach agus Séamus Ó Ceallacháin.

3. BREITHNIÚ AR MHEASTACHÁIN I GCOMHAIR SEIRBHÍSÍ POIBLÍ.

Bhreithnigh an Coiste an Meastachán (na Meastacháin) seo a leanas i gcomhair Seirbhísí Poiblí don bhliain dar críoch an 31 Nollaig, 2023 –

Vóta 45 (Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíocht) (Meastachán Athbhreithnithe)

Críochnaíodh an breithniú ar an Meastachán.

Cuireadh teachtaireacht chun na Dála de réir Bhuan-Ordú 90 á chur in iúl di gur 1. The Committee met at 5.28 p.m.

2. MEMBERS PRESENT

The following Members were present:

Deputy Paul Kehoe (in the Chair), Deputy, Deputy Niall Collins (Minister of State at the Department of Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science), Deputies Rose Conway Walsh and Jim O'Callaghan.

3. CONSIDERATION OF ESTIMATES FOR PUBLIC SERVICES.

The Committee considered the following Estimates for Public Services for the year ending 31<sup>st</sup> December 2023 –

Vote 45 (Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) (Revised Estimate).

Consideration of the Estimate was concluded.

Message sent to the Dáil in accordance with Standing Order 90 acquainting it that

Page 83 of 115

chríochnaigh an Coiste a bhreithniú ar an Meastachán.

4. Athlá.

Chuaigh an Coiste ar athló ar 5.56pm *sine die*.

the Committee had completed its consideration of the Estimate.

4. Adjournment.

The Committee adjourned at 5.56pm sine die.

Paul tet

Paul Kehoe, T.D. Cathaoirleach Date: 01 February 2023

# IMEACHTAÍ AN ROGHCHOISTE

#### **PROCEEDINGS OF THE SELECT COMMITTEE**

Dé Céadaoin, 08 Feabhra 2023

Wednesday, 08 February 2023

1. Chruinnigh an Coiste ar 17.34 p.m.

2. COMHALTAÍ I LÁTHAIR

Bhí na comhaltaí seo a leanas i láthair:

An Teachta Pól Mac Eochaidh (*i* gCeannas), An Teachta Norma Ní Fhoghlú (An tAire Oideachais), Na Teachtaí Rós. Ní Chonnmhacháin-Breathnach, Donnchadh Ó Laoghaire, Caral Uí Nualláin, Aodhán Ó Riordán, Séamus Ó Ceallacháin, Pádraig Ó Súileabháin agus Cathal Mac Concradha

3. Breithniú ar Mheastacháin i gComhair Seirbhísí Poiblí.

Bhreithnigh an Coiste an Meastachán (na Meastacháin) seo a leanas i gcomhair Seirbhísí Poiblí don bhliain dar críoch an 31 Nollaig, 2022 –

Vóta 26 (An Roinn Oideachais) (Meastachán Athbhreithnithe).

Críochnaíodh an breithniú ar an Meastachán.

Cuireadh teachtaireacht chun na Dála de réir Bhuan-Ordú 90 á chur in iúl di gur chríochnaigh an Coiste a bhreithniú ar an Meastachán.

- 1. The Committee met at 17.34 p.m.
- 2. MEMBERS PRESENT

The following Members were present:

Deputy Paul Kehoe (*in the Chair*), Deputy Norma Foley (*Minister for Education*), Deputies Rose Conway Walsh, Donnchadh Ó Laoghaire, Carol Nolan, Aodhán Ó Riordán, Jim O' Callaghan, Pádraig O' Sullivan and Cathal Crowe

3. CONSIDERATION OF ESTIMATES FOR PUBLIC SERVICES.

The Committee considered the following Estimates for Public Services for the year ending  $31^{st}$  December 2022 –

Vote 26 (Education) (Revised Estimate).

Consideration of the Estimate was concluded.

Message sent to the Dáil in accordance with Standing Order 90 informing it that the Committee had completed its consideration of the Estimate.

4. ADJOURNMENT.

Page 85 of 115

4. Athlá.

Chuaigh an Coiste ar athló ar 19.17. sine die.

The Committee adjourned at 19.17 sine die.

Paul tet

Paul Kehoe, T.D. Cathaoirleach Date: 8<sup>th</sup> February 2023

## IMEACHTAÍ AN ROGHCHOISTE UM OIDEACHAS, BREISOIDEACHAS AGUS ARDOIDEACHAS, TAIGHDE, NUÁLAÍOCHT AGUS EOLAÍOCHT

#### PROCEEDINGS OF THE SELECT COMMITTEE ON EDUCATION, FURTHER AND HIGHER EDUCATION, RESEARCH, INNOVATION AND SCIENCE

Dé Máirt 27, Meitheamh 2023

Tuesday, 27 June, 2023

1. Chruinnigh an Coiste ar 11:03 a.m.

2. COMHALTAÍ I LÁTHAIR<sup>1</sup>.

An Teachta Pól

Mac Eochaidh (i gCeannas), An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin,(Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) na Teachtaí Mairéad Ní Fhearghail, Caral Uí Nualláin, Séamus Ó Ceallacháin, Marc Ó Cathasaigh, Gino Ó Cionaoith, agus Brian Ó Loideáin. 1. The Committee met at 11:03a.m.

2. MEMBERS PRESENT<sup>2</sup>.

Deputy Paul Keogh (in the Chair), Deputy Niall Collins (Minister for State), Deputies Mairéad Farrell, Carol Nolan, Jim O'Callaghan, Marc Ó Cathasaigh, Gino Kenny and Brian Leddin.

Deputy # attended [S.O. 95(3)].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Ghlac an Teachta An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta ionad an tAire Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta [B.O. 95(1)].

Ghlac an Teachta # ionad an Teachta # [B.O. 95(2)].

Ghlac an Teachta # ionad an Teachta # (ar feadh cuid den chruinniú) [B.O. 95(2)].

Ghlac na Teachtaí # agus # ionaid na dTeachtaí # agus # faoi seach [B.O. 95(2)].

Ghlac na Teachtaí # agus # ionaid na dTeachtaí # agus # faoi seach (ar feadh cuid den chruinniú) [B.O. 95(2)].

Ghlac na Teachtaí # agus # ionaid na dTeachtaí # agus # gach re seal [B.O. 95(2)]. Ghlac na Teachtaí # agus # ionaid na dTeachtaí # agus # gach re seal (ar feadh cuid den chruinniú) [B.O. 95(2)].

Bhí an Teachta # i láthair [B.O. 95(3)].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Deputy *Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science* substituted for the Minister for Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science [S.O. 95(1)].

Deputy # substituted for Deputy # [S.O. 95(2)].

Deputy # substituted for Deputy # (for part of the meeting) [S.O. 95(2)].

Deputies # and # substituted for Deputies # and # respectively [S.O. 95(2)].

Deputies # and # substituted for Deputies # and # respectively (for part of the meeting) [S.O. 95(2)].

Deputies # and # substituted alternately for Deputies # and # [S.O. 95(2)].

Deputies # and # substituted alternately for Deputies # and # (for part of the meeting) [S.O. 95(2)].

3. AN BILLE UM CHEADÚNÚ SÁBHÁILTEACHTA FOIRGNÍOCHTA,

Chrom an Coiste ar an mBille a bhreithniú.

(*I*)*Aontaíodh 1* an t-alt.

#### (II) Alt 2

Tairgeadh leasú 1 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 2 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde,

Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 3 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

Tairgeadh leasú 4 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 5 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

Tairgeadh leasú 6 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 7 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú. 3. CONSTRUCTION SAFETY LICENSING BILL 2023.

The Committee took the Bill into consideration.

(I)Section 1 agreed to.

(II) Section 2

Amendment 1 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and *agreed to*.

Amendment 2 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed.

Amendment 3 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed

Amendment 4 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed.

Amendment 5 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed.

Amendment 6 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed

Amendment 7 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed Tairgeadh leasú 8 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

Tairgeadh leasú 9 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 10 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

*Aontaíodh* an t-alt, mar a leasaíodh. (III) Alt 3

Tairgeadh leasú 11 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú. Aontaíodh an t-alt, mar a leasaíodh. (IV) Aontaíodh 4 an t-alt.

(V) Aontaíodh 5 an t-alt.

(VI) Aontaíodh 6 an t-alt.

#### (VII) Alt 7

Tairgeadh leasú 12 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn, Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

*Aontaíodh* an t-alt, mar a leasaíodh. (VIII) Scriosadh alt 8 (IX) Alt 9

Tairgeadh leasú 13 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Amendment 8(Deputy Niall Collins. Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research. Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed Amendment 9 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research. Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed. Amendment 10 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research. Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed. Section, as amended, agreed to. (III) Section 3

Amendment 11 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed. Section, as amended, *agreed to*. (IV) Section 4 *agreed to*.

(V) Section 5 agreed to.

(VI) Section 6 agreed to.

(VII) Section 7

Amendment 12 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed.

Section, as amended, *agreed to*. (VIII) Section 8 *deleted*. (IX) Section 9

Amendment 13 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education,

Page 89 of 115

Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus cinneadh aontach a rinneadh air – cuireadh isteach an t-alt nua. Aontaíodh an t-alt, mar a leasaíodh. (X) Aontaíodh 10 an t-alt.

(XI) Aontaíodh 11 an t-alt.

#### (XII) Alt 12

Tairgeadh leasú 14 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 15 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 16 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

Tairgeadh leasú 17 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

Tairgeadh leasú 18 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 19 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Aontaíodh an t-alt, mar a leasaíodh.

(XIII) Scriosadh alt 13.

(XIV) Scriosadh alt14.

(XV) Aontaíodh 15 an t-alt.

#### (XVI) Alt 16

Tairgeadh leasú 20 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn ,

Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and decided in the affirmative – new section inserted. Section, as amended, agreed to. (X) Section 10 agreed to.

(XI) Section 11 agreed to.

(XII) Section 12

Amendment 14 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and *agreed to*.

Amendment 15 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and *agreed to*.

Amendment 16 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 17 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to

Amendment 18 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 19 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Section, as amended, agreed to.

(XIII) Section 13 deleted.

(XIV) Section 14 deleted.

(XV) Section 15 agreed to.

(XVI) Section 16

Amendment 20 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) *agus aontaíodh an leasú -cuireadh isteach an t-alt nua*.

Tairgeadh leasú 21 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn, Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 22 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn, Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

*Aontaíodh* an t-alt, mar a leasaíodh. *(XVII) Aontaíodh 17* an t-alt.

#### (XVIII) Alt 18

Tairgeadh leasú 23 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 24 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 25 (Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

*Aontaíodh* an t-alt, mar a leasaíodh. (XIX) Alt 19

Tairgeadh leasú 26 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Aontaíodh an t-alt, mar a leasaíodh.

Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and *agreed to – new section inserted*.

Amendment 21 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and *agreed to* 

Amendment 22 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and *agreed to* Section, as amended, *agreed to*.

(XVII) Section 17 agreed to.

# (XVIII) Section 18

Amendment 23 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research. Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to Amendment 24 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research. Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to Amendment 25 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Innovation and Science) Research. proposed and agreed to Section, as amended, agreed to. (XIX) Section 19

Amendment 26 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to. Section, as amended, *agreed to*.

# (XX) Alt 20

Tairgeadh leasú 27 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn, Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú -cuireadh isteach an t-alt nua.

Tairgeadh leasú 28 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú -cuireadh isteach an talt nua.

Tairgeadh leasú 29 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú -cuireadh isteach an talt nua.

Tairgeadh leasú 30 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú -cuireadh isteach an talt nua.

Tairgeadh leasú 31 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú -cuireadh isteach an talt nua.

Tairgeadh leasú 32 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú -cuireadh isteach an talt nua.

Scriosadh alt 20.

(XXI) Scriosadh alt 21. (XXII) Aontaíodh 22 an t-alt.

# (XXIII) Alt 23

Tairgeadh leasú 33 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus (XX) Section 20

Amendment 27 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to – new section inserted.

Amendment 28 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to – new section inserted.

Amendment 29 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to – new section inserted.

Amendment 30 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to – new section inserted.

Amendment 31 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to – new section inserted.

Amendment 32 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to – new section inserted..

Section 20 *deleted*. (XXI) Section 21 *deleted*. (XXII) Section 22 *agreed to*.

# (XXIII) Section 23

Amendment 33 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) aontaíodh an leasú -cuireadh isteach an talt nua.

Tairgeadh leasú 34 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú -cuireadh isteach an t-alt nua..

Tairgeadh leasú 35 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 36 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn, Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

*Aontaíodh* an t-alt, mar a leasaíodh. (XXIV) Alt 24

Tairgeadh leasú 37 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú..

*Aontaíodh* an t-alt, mar a leasaíodh. (XXV) Alt 25

Tairgeadh leasú 38 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú..

*Aontaíodh* an t-alt, mar a leasaíodh. *(XXVI) Aontaíodh 26* an t-alt.

(XXVII) Aontaíodh 27 an t-alt.

#### (XXVIII) Alt 28

Tairgeadh leasú 39 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.. proposed and agreed to – new section inserted.

Amendment 34 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to – new section inserted.

Amendment 35 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and *agreed to*.

Amendment 36 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to. Section, as amended, agreed to.

(XXIV) Section 24

Amendment 37 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to Section, as amended, *agreed to*. (XXV) Section 25

Amendment 38 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to. Section, as amended, *agreed to*. (XXVI) Section 26 *agreed to*.

(XXVII) Section 27 agreed to.

#### (XXVIII) Section 28

Amendment 39 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to

Page 93 of 115

*Aontaíodh* an t-alt, mar a leasaíodh. *(XXIX) Aontaíodh 29* an t-alt.

#### (XXX) Alt 30

Tairgeadh leasú 40 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 41 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú..

Tairgeadh leasú 42 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú..

Tairgeadh leasú 43 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú..

Tairgeadh leasú 44 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú..

*Aontaíodh* an t-alt, mar a leasaíodh. (XXXI) Alt 31

Tairgeadh leasú 45 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú..

Tairgeadh leasú 46 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 47 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú. Section, as amended, *agreed to*. (XXIX) Section 29 *agreed to*.

#### (XXX) Section 30

Amendment 40 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to. Amendment 41 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research. Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to Amendment 42 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to. Amendment 43 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to. Amendment 44 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Innovation and Research, Science) proposed and agreed to Section, as amended, agreed to. (XXXI) Section 31 Amendment 45 (Deputy Niall Collins,

Amendment 45 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to Amendment 46 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to

Amendment 47 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to Tairgeadh leasú 48 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 49 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 50 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

*Aontaíodh* an t-alt, mar a leasaíodh. (XXXII) Alt 32

Tairgeadh leasú 51 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 52 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn, Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

Tairgeadh leasú 53 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 54 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

Tairgeadh leasú 55 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn, Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

*Aontaíodh* an t-alt, mar a leasaíodh. (XXXII) Alt 33

Amendment 48 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to

Amendment 49 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to

Amendment 50 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to Section, as amended, *agreed to*.

(XXXII) Section 32

Amendment 51 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to. Amendment 52 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science)

proposed and agreed to Amendment 53 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 54 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 55 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to

Section, as amended, *agreed to*. (XXXIII) Section 33

Tairgeadh leasú 56 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú. Tairgeadh leasú 57 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas Ardoideachas, agus Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú Tairgeadh leasú 58 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas Ardoideachas, agus Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú Tairgeadh leasú 59 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas Ardoideachas, agus Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú Aontaíodh an t-alt, mar a leasaíodh. (XXXIV) Alt 33

Tairgeadh leasú 60 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn, Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú -cuireadh isteach an t-alt nua. Scriosadh alt 34. (XXXV) Aontaíodh 35 an t-alt.

# (XXXVI) Alt 36

Tairgeadh leasú 61 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn, Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú. Aontaíodh an t-alt, mar a leasaíodh. (XXXVI) Alt 37

Tairgeadh leasú 62 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú Tairgeadh leasú 63 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Amendment 56 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 57 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 58 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 59 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to Section, as amended, *agreed to*. (XXXIV) Section 34

Amendment 60 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and *agreed to – new section inserted*. Section 34 *deleted*. (XXXV) Section 35 *agreed to*.

# (XXXVI) Section 36

Amendment 61 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to. Section, as amended, *agreed to*. (XXXVII) Section 37

Amendment 62 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 63 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú Aontaíodh an t-alt, mar a leasaíodh. (XXXVIII) Alt 38

Tairgeadh leasú 64 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas. Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú Tairgeadh leasú 65 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas Ardoideachas. agus Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú Tairgeadh leasú 66 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú Aontaíodh an t-alt, mar a leasaíodh. (XXXIX) Alt 39

Tairgeadh leasú 67 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas Ardoideachas, agus Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú Tairgeadh leasú 68 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , **Breisoideachas** Ardoideachas, agus Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú Tairgeadh leasú 69 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , **Breisoideachas** Ardoideachas, agus Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú. Tairgeadh leasú 70 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas Ardoideachas, agus Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú. Aontaíodh an t-alt, mar a leasaíodh. (XL) Scriosadh alt 40.

 $(\mathbf{XL})$  Schosault all 40.

(XLI) Scriosadh alt 41.

Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to Section, as amended, *agreed to*. (XXXVIII) Section 38

Amendment 64 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to. Amendment 65 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research. Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to. Amendment 66 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to. Section, as amended, agreed to. (XXXIX) Section 39

Amendment 67 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 68 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 69 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to

Amendment 70 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Section, as amended, *agreed to*.

(XL) Section 40 *deleted*.

(XLI) Section 41 *deleted*.

Page 97 of 115

(XLII) Scriosadh alt 42. (XLIII) Scriosadh alt 43. (XLIV) Alt 44

Tairgeadh leasú 71 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn, Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 72 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 73 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú..

Tairgeadh leasú 74 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn, Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 75 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn, Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú..

Tairgeadh leasú 76 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn, Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 77 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn, Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú..

Tairgeadh leasú 78 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn, Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú..

Tairgeadh leasú 79 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.. (XLII) Section 42 *deleted*. (XLIII) Section 43 *deleted*. (XLIV) Section 44

Amendment 71 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Innovation and Research, Science) proposed and agreed to. Amendment 72 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research. Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to Amendment 73 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to. Amendment 74 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Innovation and Science) Research. proposed and agreed to Amendment 75 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research. Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to. Amendment 76 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to. Amendment 77 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research. Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to. Amendment 78 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research. Innovation and Science)

proposed and agreed to. Amendment 79 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to. Tairgeadh leasú 80 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn, Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú..

Tairgeadh leasú 81 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 82 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn, Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú..

*Aontaíodh* an t-alt, mar a leasaíodh. (XLV) Alt 45

Tairgeadh leasú 83 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

Tairgeadh leasú 84 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

Tairgeadh leasú 85 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

Tairgeadh leasú 86 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

*Aontaíodh* an t-alt, mar a leasaíodh. (*XLVI*) *Aontaíodh 46* an t-alt.

#### (XLVII) Alt 47

Tairgeadh leasú 87 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Amendment 80 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to

Amendment 81 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 82 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Section, as amended, *agreed to*. (XLV) Section 45

Amendment 83 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to Amendment 84 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education,

Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to Amendment 85 (Deputy Niall Collins,

Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 86 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Section, as amended, *agreed to*. (XLVI) Section 46 *agreed to*.

#### (XLVII) Section 47

Amendment 87 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 88 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

Tairgeadh leasú 89 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

Tairgeadh leasú 90 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

Tairgeadh leasú 91 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

Tairgeadh leasú 92 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

*Aontaíodh* an t-alt, mar a leasaíodh. (XLVIII) Alt 48

Tairgeadh leasú 93 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

Tairgeadh leasú 94 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

Tairgeadh leasú 95 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

Tairgeadh leasú 96 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 88 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 89 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to

Amendment 90 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to

Amendment 91 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 92 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Section, as amended, *agreed to*. (XLVIII) Section 48

Amendment 93 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to

Amendment 94 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to

Amendment 95 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to

Amendment 96 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

Tairgeadh leasú 97 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

Tairgeadh leasú 98 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

Tairgeadh leasú 99 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

Aontaíodh an t-alt, mar a leasaíodh. (XLIX) Alt 48

Tairgeadh leasú 100 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

Tairgeadh leasú 101 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

Tairgeadh leasú 102 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

Tairgeadh leasú 103 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

Tairgeadh leasú 104 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

Tairgeadh leasú 105 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn ,

Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to

Amendment 97 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to

Amendment 98 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to

Amendment 99 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to Section, as amended, *agreed to*.

(XLIX) Section 49

Amendment 100 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to

Amendment 101 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 102 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 103 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 104 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 105 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú *Aontaíodh* an t-alt, mar a leasaíodh. (L) Alt 50

Tairgeadh leasú 106 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn], Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

Tairgeadh leasú 107 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn, Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 108 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn, Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 109 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

Tairgeadh leasú 110 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn, Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú. Aontaíodh an t-alt, mar a leasaíodh.

(LI) Alt 51

Tairgeadh leasú 111 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 112 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú..

Tairgeadh leasú 113 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to Section, as amended, *agreed to*. (L)Section 50

Amendment 106 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) ) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 107 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 108 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to

Amendment 109 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 110 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to. Section, as amended, *agreed to*. (LI) Section 51

Amendment 111 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 112 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to

Amendment 113 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú..

Tairgeadh leasú 114 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú..

Tairgeadh leasú 115 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

*Aontaíodh* an t-alt, mar a leasaíodh. (LII) Alt 52

Tairgeadh leasú 116 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 117 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 118 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 119 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 120 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

Tairgeadh leasú 121 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

Tairgeadh leasú 122 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn ,

Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 114 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 115 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Section, as amended, *agreed to*. (LII) Section 52

Amendment 116 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 117 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 118 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 119 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to

Amendment 120 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to

Amendment 121 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to

Amendment 122 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

Tairgeadh leasú 123 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 124 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 125 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

Tairgeadh leasú 126 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

*Aontaíodh* an Sceideal, mar a leasaíodh. (LIII) Alt 53

Tairgeadh leasú 127 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

Tairgeadh leasú 128 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

Tairgeadh leasú 129 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

Tairgeadh leasú 130 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

Tairgeadh leasú 131 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 123 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 124 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 125 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 126 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Schedule, as amended, *agreed to* (LIII) Section 53

Amendment 127 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 128 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 129 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 130 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to

Amendment 131 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

Tairgeadh leasú 132 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

*Aontaíodh* an t-alt, mar a leasaíodh. (LIV) Alt 54

Tairgeadh leasú 133 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 134 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 135 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 136 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 137 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 138 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 139 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 140 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 132 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to Section, as amended, *agreed to*. (LIV) Section 54

Amendment 133 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 134 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 135 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to

Amendment 136 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to

Amendment 137 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 138 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to

Amendment 139 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to

Amendment 140 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 141 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 142 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 143 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 144 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 145 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 146 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 147 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

Tairgeadh leasú 148 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 149 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Aontaíodh an t-alt, mar a leasaíodh.

Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to

Amendment 141 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to

Amendment 142 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 143 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 144 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to

Amendment 145 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to

Amendment 146 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 147 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to

Amendment 148 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to

Amendment 149 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Section, as amended, *agreed to*.

## (LV) Alt 55

Tairgeadh leasú 150 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 151 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 152 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

Tairgeadh leasú 153 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

Tairgeadh leasú 154 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

Tairgeadh leasú 155 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Aontaíodh an t-alt, mar a leasaíodh. (LVI) Aontaíodh 56 an t-alt.

# (LVII) Alt 57

Tairgeadh leasú 156 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú..

Tairgeadh leasú 157 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

# (LV) Section 55

Amendment 150 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 151 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 152 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 153 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 154 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 155 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Section, as amended, *agreed to*.

(LVI) Section 56 agreed to.

# (LVII) Section 57

Amendment 156 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 157 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Page 107 of 115

Tairgeadh leasú 158 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 159 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

*Aontaíodh* an t-alt, mar a leasaíodh. (LVIII) Alt 58

Tairgeadh leasú 160 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 161 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 162 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 163 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

*Aontaíodh* an t-alt, mar a leasaíodh. (LIX) Alt 59

Tairgeadh leasú 164 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 165 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 166 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Amendment 158 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to

Amendment 159 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Section, as amended, *agreed to*. (LVIII) Section 58

Amendment 160 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 161 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 162 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Amendment 163 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to.

Section, as amended, *agreed to*. (LIX) Section 59

Amendment 164 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to

Amendment 165 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to

Amendment 166 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 167 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 168 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 169 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 170 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

*Aontaíodh* an t-alt, mar a leasaíodh. (LX) Alt 60

Tairgeadh leasú 171 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn, Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú -cuireadh isteach an t-alt nua.

Tairgeadh leasú 172 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 173 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

*Aontaíodh* an Sceideal, mar a leasaíodh. *(LXI) Aontaíodh* 61 an t-alt.

Research. Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to Amendment 167 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Science) Research. Innovation and proposed and agreed to Amendment 168 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to Amendment 169 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Innovation Science) Research, and proposed and agreed to Amendment 170 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research. Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to Section, as amended, agreed to. (LX) Section 60

Amendment 171 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and *agreed to – new section inserted*.

Amendment 172 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to

Amendment 173 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to

Schedule, as amended, *agreed to* (LXI) Section 61 *agreed to*.

(LXII) Alt 62

(LXII) Section 62

Tairgeadh leasú 174 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn , Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú Tairgeadh leasú 175 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn ,

Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú

Tairgeadh leasú 176 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

*Aontaíodh* an t-alt, mar a leasaíodh. *(LXIII) Aontaíodh* 63 an t-alt.

# (LXIV)

Tairgeadh leasú 177 (An Teachta Mairéad Farrell) agus tarraingíodh siar an leasú, faoi chead.

Tairgeadh leasú 178 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn, Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 179 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 180 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn, Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 181 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 182 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Aontaíodh an Sceideal, mar a leasaíodh.

Amendment 174 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to Amendment 175 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research. Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to Amendment 176 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Innovation Science) Research. and proposed and agreed to Section, as amended, agreed to. (LXIII) Section 63 agreed to.

# (LXIV)

Amendment 177 (*Deputy Mairéad Farrell*) proposed and, by leave, *withdrawn*.

Amendment 178 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to

Amendment 179 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to

Amendment 180 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to

Amendment 181 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to

Amendment 182 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to

Schedule, as amended, agreed to

#### (LXV) An Teideal.

Tairgeadh leasú 183 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn, Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 184 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn, Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

Tairgeadh leasú 185 (An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, Aire Stáit ag an Roinn, Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíochta) agus aontaíodh an leasú.

*Aontaíodh* an Teideal, mar a leasaíodh. . ATHLÁ.

Chuaigh an Coiste ar athló ar 11:56 a.m. *sine die.* 

(LXV) Title.

Amendment 183 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to. Amendment 184 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to Amendment 185 (Deputy Niall Collins, Minister of State at the Department of Education, Further and Higher Education, Research. Innovation and Science) proposed and agreed to Title, as amended, agreed to.

ADJOURNMENT.

The Committee adjourned at 11:56 a.m. *sine die.* 

# IMEACHTAÍ AN ROGHCHOISTE

### **PROCEEDINGS OF THE SELECT COMMITTEE**

[Dé Máirt] 28, Samhain, 2023

Tuesday, 28 November, 2023

1. Chruinnigh an Coiste ar 11:03 a.m.

2. Comhaltaí i Láthair<sup>1</sup>.

Bhí na comhaltaí seo a leanas i láthair:

An Teachta, Mairéad Ní Fhearghail (*i* gCeannas), An Teachta Niall Ó Coileáin, (an tAire Stáit ag an Roinn Breisoideachais agus Ardoideachais, Taighde, Nuálaíochta agus Eolaíochta), na Teachtaí Séamus Ó Ceallacháin agus. Pól Mac Amhlaoibh, l

3. Breithniú ar Mheastacháin i gComhair Seirbhísí Poiblí.

Bhreithnigh an Coiste an Meastachán (na Meastacháin) seo a leanas i gcomhair Seirbhísí Poiblí don bhliain dar críoch an 31 Nollaig, 2023 –

> Vóta 45 (Vóta 45 (Breisoideachas agus Ardoideachas, Taighde, Nuálaíocht agus Eolaíocht) (Meastachán Forlíontach).

Críochnaíodh an breithniú ar an Meastachán.

Cuireadh teachtaireacht chun na Dála de réir Bhuan-Ordú 90 á chur in iúl di gur chríochnaigh an Coiste a bhreithniú ar an Meastachán.

4. Athlá.

1. The Committee met at 11:03 a.m.

2. MEMBERS PRESENT<sup>2</sup>.

The following Members were present:

Deputy Máiread Farrell (*in the Chair*), Deputy Niall Collins (*Minister of State at the Department of Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science*) Deputies Jim O'Callaghan and Paul McAuliffe.

3. CONSIDERATION OF ESTIMATES FOR PUBLIC SERVICES.

The Committee considered the following Estimate(s) for Public Services for the year ending 31st December, 2023 –

Vote 45 (Further and Higher Education, Research, Innovation and Science) (Supplementary Estimate).

Consideration of the Estimate was concluded.

Message sent to the Dáil in accordance with Standing Order 90 informing it that the Committee had completed its consideration of the Estimate.

4. Adjournment.

Chuaigh an Coiste ar athló ar 11:46 a.m. sine die.

The Committee adjourned at 11:46 a.m. *sine die./* 

Paul tet

Paul Kehoe, T.D., PP Cathaoirleach 28 November 2023

# IMEACHTAÍ AN ROGHCHOISTE

#### **PROCEEDINGS OF THE SELECT COMMITTEE**

[Dé Céadaoin] 29, Samhain, 2023

Wednesday, 29 November, 2023

1. Chruinnigh an Coiste ar 18:05 p.m.

2. Comhaltaí i Láthair.

Bhí na comhaltaí seo a leanas i láthair:

An Teachta Pól Mac Eochaidh, (*i* gCeannas), Norma Ní Fhoghlú (An tAire Oideachais) na Teachtaí Sorcha Uí Chléirigh,Cathal Mac Concradha, Mairéad Ní Fhearghail, Séamus Ó Ceallacháin, Marc Ó Cathasaigh agus Pádraig Ó Súileabháin,,

3. BREITHNIÚ AR MHEASTACHÁIN I GCOMHAIR SEIRBHÍSÍ POIBLÍ.

Bhreithnigh an Coiste an Meastachán (na Meastacháin) seo a leanas i gcomhair Seirbhísí Poiblí don bhliain dar críoch an 31 Nollaig, 2023 –

Vóta 26 (An Roinn Oideachais) (Meastachán Forlíontach).

Críochnaíodh an breithniú ar an Meastachán.

Cuireadh teachtaireacht chun na Dála de réir Bhuan-Ordú 90 á chur in iúl di gur chríochnaigh an Coiste a bhreithniú ar an Meastachán.

4. Athlá.

1. The Committee met at 18:05p.m.

2. Members Present.

The following Members were present:

Deputy Paul Kehoe (*in the Chair*), Deputy Norma Foley (*Minister for Education*), Deputies Sorca Clarke, Cathal Crowe, Máiread Farrell, Jim O'Callaghan, Marc Ó Cathasaigh and Pádraig O'Sullivan.

3. CONSIDERATION OF ESTIMATES FOR PUBLIC SERVICES.

The Committee considered the following Estimate(s) for Public Services for the year ending 31st December, 2023 –

Vote 26 (Education) (Supplementary Estimate).

Consideration of the Estimate was concluded.

Message sent to the Dáil in accordance with Standing Order 90 informing it that the Committee had completed its consideration of the Estimate.

4. Adjournment.

Chuaigh an Coiste ar athló ar 19:17 p.m. sine die.

The Committee adjourned at 19:37p.m. *sine die*.

Paul tet

Paul Keogh, T.D. Cathaoirleach 29<sup>th</sup> November 2023